

6. EVALUATION OF TRAINING

6.1

ANAND K.K.

Evaluation of Training

Indian Management

Delhi

(India) 11(6)

pp.11-19

Cost benefit analysis of training is important from two points of view: firstly, training as a specialist function cannot grow unless its activities are subjected to a cost-benefit analysis; secondly, cost-benefit analysis will provide necessary feed-back about the utilization of resources allocated to the training function. An initial step in cost-benefit analysis of training is the identification of costs which are amenable to quantification in monetary terms. An analytical approach developed in an Indian company is described.

6.2

BARE C.E. &
MITCHELL R.R.

Experimental Evaluation of Sensitivity
Training

**Journal of Applied Behavioural
Science**

Arlington

(USA) 8(3)

pp.263-76

The results of laboratory experiment undertaken to (a) determine whether significant behavioural changes occur as a result of sensitivity training, and (b) compare the effectiveness of three sensitivity training groups, showed that experimental subjects reflected more rapid behavioural change than did control group subjects at the conclusion of training and after a three months' follow-up period. The data also indicated that the combination pattern of time was more effective than the spaced pattern but no inter-pattern differences were significant at the three months' follow-up.

6.3

BELASCO JAMES A.
& TRICE
HARRISON M.

**The Assessment of Change in Training
and Therapy**

McGraw Hill

New York

(USA)

1969

pp.166

The book is primarily directed to strategic problems of evaluation and training evaluation for explaining change. Evaluation is assumed to be a means of understanding the change process, and only incidentally as a means of

measuring its results. The advantages of evaluation are indicated; pinpointing needs, diagnostic tool for organisational analyses, comparative effectiveness of different change techniques or different trainers, recording the results of change efforts and to suggest methods to improve the effectiveness of change efforts. The attitudinal and organisational obstructions to evaluation are also identified.

6.4

BLUMENFELD
WARREN S. &
HOLLAND MAX G.

A Model for the Empirical Evaluation
of Training Effectiveness

Personnel Journal

Swarthmore, Pa.

(USA)

50(8)

August 1971

pp.637-640

The article is concerned with the quality of accountability evidence, specifically with (1) the demonstration of the effectiveness of training, and (2) the quality of the evidence to demonstrate that effectiveness. Training is concerned as learning and criterion of measurement as part of experimental design are outlined. It is explained that a design without pretest and post test does not generate evidence of behavior change, and a design without a control group does not generate evidence of the extent to which any measured, behavior change might have been caused by the treatment (training). A design lacking in either of these two characteristics is not quality evidence.

6.5

BORUS M.E. (ed)

**The Impact of Manpower Programs:
An Evaluation**

Lexington Books

Lexington,
Mass

(USA)

1971

pp.280

The volume covers the entire spectrum of evaluation. Some authors give basic factual data needed in evaluation process. Others offer techniques to improve present practices. Finally, several authors give theoretical and practical guidelines for development of future evaluation methodology. The chapters include designing an evaluation system, choice of appropriate control groups, designing survey instruments, measuring non-economic impacts and sources of data.

6.6

BUNKER KERRY A.& Evaluating Organisational Training Efforts
COHEN STEPHEN L.

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 32(8) August 1978

The article seeks to offer some possible explanations for the existing inadequacies in most training evaluations. In view of the implications it is not surprising that training personnel are hesitant to undertake evaluation efforts that might appear to invalidate one's own developmental activities. Further, the evaluation process itself can sometimes jeopardize the internal validity of the training through pretest effects. Accordingly, the implications for organisational training evaluation are stated for the trainer.

6.7

BURGOYNE J.G. Judgment Process in Management Students'
Evaluation of Their Learning Experiences

Human Relations New York
(USA) 28(6) 1975 pp.543-69

Several management development evaluation studies rely on the compilation, after the programme, of evaluation opinions from the participants. This research investigates the process of judgment underlying the formation of evaluative opinions by programme participants. The methodology of 'practical analysis', used so far mainly in laboratory studies is employed. The results show that a certain amount of validity can be attached to opinion-based follow-up studies, and that there is the possibility of designing such studies to improve the validity of the conclusions.

6.8

CHAPMAN R.S. Selecting the Most Appropriate Evaluation Design
for Management and Development Courses

European Training Bradford
(UK) 1(3) pp.253-261

There are three basic evaluation designs used in current evaluation research differentiated by the degree of thoroughness involved. But before the design can be chosen it must be clear whether the objectives of the management development are individual objectives, organisational objectives or environmental objectives.

There are controversies about the problem of evaluation and measurement of impact. The purpose of the evaluation project is also not always clear, as it may be summative or formative. The appropriate design is one that can meet the required objectives at a minimum cost.

6.9

CHRISTOPHER K.J. Evaluation of Training - A Few Considerations and An Experience

I.S.T.D. Review

New Delhi

(India)

2(3-4)

1972

pp.91-101

It is argued, on the basis of experience, that it is possible to evaluate changed behavior of participants in their work situations both in quantitative and qualitative terms. A summary of such an evaluation carved out at a Central Training Institute in Hyderabad is reported. This evaluation was from the participants, from their superiors, peers and subordinates. The author feels that given proper attention, evaluation studies can be designed by trainers.

6.10

CLAYCOMBL W.W. An Evaluation of Supervisory Skills to
et al Determine Training Needs

Personnel Journal

Santa Monica

(USA)

55(3)

March 1976

pp.116-120

The exercise was based on an initial evaluation of supervisory skills through four forms: supervisory evaluation form, the self-evaluation form, the supervisory interview form and the time percentage form. These forms were accompanied by detailed instructions. The scoring procedure of Blanz and Ghisalli was employed. The subordinate-supervisor ratings were later plotted. In the study under reference, training needs were clearly indicated in personal communication with emphasis on motivation. There was a general weakness in recognition of accomplishment. A profile of training needs was thus evolved.

6.11

COUCH PETER D. A Critical Incident Evaluation of
& STROTHER Supervisory Training
GEORGE B.

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 25(9) September 1971 pp.6-11

The study suggests that classroom supervisory training has a broad positive impact in that it enables the individual to learn more from on-the-job experience than he would have without training. As an indirect evaluation of training, it focusses on the question of whether or not training makes people 'better learners about supervising'. The affirmative answer to this question has implications for the design and comprehensive supervisory development programs using both classroom and on-the-job experiences.

6.12

COWELL DONALD W. Evaluating the Effectiveness of Management
Courses

European Training Bradford
(UK) I(1) Spring 1972 pp.55-67

The paper presents the conventional framework adopted by evaluation of management education programmes and examines by reference to recent research some specific problems which can arise in applying such a framework in practice. The need for the evaluation of management education to assess its benefits for both individuals and organisations is stressed. It is concluded that the evaluation of management education should lead also to an improvement in the quality of evaluative tools and procedures available and to the more effective design of courses based upon a better understanding of the content and instructional methods suitable for management education.

6.13

DENOVA CHARLES C. **Test Construction for Training Evaluation**

Van Nostrand Reinhold New York
(USA) 1979 pp.118

The refinement of testing procedures in recent years has led to widespread use of testing devices in different categories of training programme. The book emphasises practical applications rather than abstract management

theory and offers essential procedures for selecting test terms, constructing different types of tests, using the tests to maximum advantage, administering the tests, and evaluating test results. The analysis is outlined from the viewpoint of the training staff and the trainer with guidelines for relevant implementation. It is explained how a test is a valuable tool when utilised in personnel training and development. Methods are discussed for designing essay, oral, true-false, multiple choice, matching, fill-in, and other types of tests.

6.14

DRESSEL PAUL L. **Handbook of Academic Evaluation**

Jossey-Bass Publishers London
(UK) 1976 pp.518

The author presents a complete analysis of all phases of evaluation - from formulating objectives, determining costs, and collecting data to measuring programme and institutional success, identifying undesirable effects and recommending change. He shows how shifts in resource allocation, revised institutional priorities, and improved teaching and learning can result from evaluation; how evaluation can pinpoint future needs and appraise potentials. Part III relating to evaluation of programmes and personnel provides insight regarding curriculum and faculty.

6.15

DOYLE KENNETH O. **Student Evaluation of Institution**
Jr.

Heath London
(UK) 1975 pp.143

An approach based on ratings in instructional evaluation at the University level is outlined and discussed. A range of theoretical and practical aspects in the approach are identified and examined in the context of effective, objective evaluation. A selection of representative student evaluation forms are appended.

6.19

GHIRNIKAR L.N. Evaluating Executive Development

I.S.T.D. Review

Delhi

(India) 2(1) 1972 pp.14-17

The author attempts to establish some key reasons for the failure of some executive development programmes. These include: unsuitable organisational climate, insufficient management commitment, executive trainee selection without proper scientific basis, lack of need-based training programmes. Individually as well as cumulatively, these reasons block the learning outcome of training programmes.

6.20

GOLDSTEIN IRWIN L. The Pursuit of Internal and External Validity in the Evaluation of Training Programs

Public Personnel Management

Washington D.C.

(USA) 8(6) 1979 pp.416-428

The article explores internal validity (did the training make a difference in the particular situation?) and external validity (can the results of intervention be generalized to other situations?) Training validity is explained as the establishment of treatment effects as a result of the instructional program. The authors visualise a hierarchy of training, performance, intra-organisational and inter-organisational validity. It is stressed that it is necessary to realise that the establishment of training validity still requires careful need assessment and evaluation procedures.

6.21

GOLDSTEIN IRWIN L. **Training: Program Development and Evaluation**

Wadsworth Publishing

Belmont,
Calif.

(USA) 1974 pp.231

The book is addressed to those concerned with the systematic development and evaluation of training programs in a variety of organisational settings. It is in three parts, assessment and evaluation, the learning environment and instructional approaches. Part One emphasises that once instructional needs are assessed and objectives determined, evaluation provides information useful in modifying the training program. Part Two

presents the theoretical and empirical bases of learning, which provides the foundation for the design of instructional environments. Part Three explains a variety of instructional techniques. The author provides a general description and discussion of the evaluation data, with particular emphasis on the questions that must be answered, and summaries of the advantages and disadvantages of each approach.

6.22

GORDON MICHAEL E. Three Ways to Effectively Evaluate Personnel Programs

Personnel Journal

Swarthmore, Pa.

(USA)

51(7)

July 1972

pp.498-504

It is argued that failure to validate personnel programs can be expensive, although the actual costs are difficult to estimate. The failure to assess the effectiveness of personnel procedures frequently is traceable to misguided notions concerning the necessity of validation. The evaluation of personnel programs cannot be managed on the basis of intuition and good intention. There will be need for greater sophistication to properly direct the process of program evaluation. The use of behavioral objectives will assist in overcoming the criterion problem in program evaluation.

6.23

GOSLIN R.C. Methodological Approaches in Public Administration Training

International Review of Administrative Sciences

Brussels

(Belgium)

XLI(1)

1975

pp.1-15

It is argued that the selection of training methods and the application of learning technology will depend upon design and content of materials. Also the results of learning will become more easily determined if methods and measures are chosen when the component objectives are established within the overall programme. If training is to be effective and efficient, trainers must contribute to the training process through planned team work and even acquire expertise in more areas than those for which they were initially qualified. The utilisation of training objectives likely to be achieved during or by the end of the programme by a formal training methodology is also discussed. Appendices provide assessment analysis in handling training sessions and a check list of task behaviour.

6.24

GOSLIN R.C. Defining Contexts and Procedures for
Effective Evaluation of Course Programmes

**International Review of Administrative
Sciences**

Brussels

(Belgium) XLII(1) 1976 pp.56-67

The article attempts to focus upon two aspects - adequate approaches and the selection of practical procedures and techniques for evaluation. The essential elements in evaluation studies, construction of evaluation measures and the evaluation roles are outlined. The need for collection and organisation of reliable data is discussed. It is also pointed out that interpretation and judgment of data is basic to appreciating the achievement of evaluation objectives.

6.25

GUYOT JAMES F. How Do We Know which Training is Good
Medicine for Managers?

Public Administration Review

(USA) 37(6) Nov./Dec. 1977 pp.698-705

It is explained that training, especially that undertaken at the managerial level is often thought to be a rewarding investment in the future, but we have so far little evidence of its pay-off we believe that through training, the organisation leadership hopes to shape the organisational climate. The author reports the studies of two training programs indicating the methodological difficulties in making an evaluation of such training. The possible approaches for research to improve the quality of training are outlined. In this context, the aspects of control group and training effect are discussed.

6.26

HAND H.H. Mystery of Executive Education -
Effectiveness Requires Evaluation

Business Horizons

Bloomington

(USA) 14(3) 1971 pp.35-8

The problems in the evaluation of management development programmes are identified. These include: defining parameters, verbalising the basic assumptions, and evaluating the results. For useful evaluation, objective criteria should replace subjective criteria and multiple

rating may supplement self-evaluation. The programme should provide an opportunity to define objectives with respect to change; the systematic evaluation of the value of executive development expenditures as well as a basis for revising future programmes.

6.27

HAND H.H. et al Organizational Climate and the Effectiveness of a Human Relations Training Program

Academy of Management Journal Mississippi
(USA) 16(2) 1973 pp.185-95

The results of a research program to evaluate the changes in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour of participants in a middle management human relations training program are described. The evaluation was in three stages: one prior to training, one ninety days after training, and one eighteen months after the completion of training. In the second stage evaluation, little change was observed in attitudes and behaviour but in the third stage significant positive changes in attitudes were noticed. Negative changes were observed in the control group. The trainees perception of the organisational climate moderated these findings.

6.28

HESSELING P. **Strategy of Evaluation Research**

Van Gorcum & Co. Assen
(Netherlands) 1966 pp.359

Concepts, methods, and a strategy to help trainers to carry out evaluation studies are described. Evaluation is explained as the means of planning, controlling and assessing the process of change in a systematic manner with focus on supervisory and management training. The book is in three parts. The first part explains the principles of perception, learning and evaluation. The second part shows how these principles have been applied including in detail the methods used. Part three is concerned with the strategy of evaluation training including an examination of the training officer as evaluator. The appendices include extensive references.

6.29

HONEY P. &
MORRIS M.

Practical Experiences in Evaluating
Management Training

Personnel Management

London

(UK)

5(1)

1973

pp.29-33

The author describes evaluation of management training and considers it in three parts or stages - pre-training stage. An evaluation design has been developed and implemented by the author in ICL. The results as reported indicate its practical applicability. The task of a trainer in practising the design is mentioned.

6.30

HOLDER JACK J.

Evaluation of an In-Company Management
Training Program

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

26(4)

April 1972

pp.24-27

This is a research report on changes in behaviour of participants and their organisation. It is indicated that the extent of benefits from the in-company training programs will depend on several factors e.g. the true effectiveness of the trainer and his ability to impart knowledge in a classroom situation; ability of participants to grasp the material and synthesize the theory with their knowledge of practical application to get active results and the superior-subordinate relationship the supervisor actually has in his work situation as this will greatly determine the extent to which he will be encouraged to apply the new learning to his job.

6.31

JONES J.A.G.

Towards a Classification of Benefits
of Training

European Training

Bradford

(UK)

1(3)

1972

pp.212-21

A survey of the cost-benefit analysis of training revealed three broad categories of benefits: direct changes, indirect changes and long-term changes. These are identified and discussed. Some of these categories include: changes in the performance of others affected by the work of the trainees, changes in the levels of ability and changes in the degree of flexibility or adaptability. The discussion emphasises the context of operative training.

6.32

KAYLOFF ALVIN G. A Method for Evaluating the Effectiveness
of Technical Training

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 25(6) June 1971 pp.24-30

A matrix approach for classifying tasks by importance and training levels is explained. It is stated that task proficiency measurement for a technical training is relatively simple to collect. Training level is an objective for courses and task importance estimates can be readily obtained for any job by conducting a job survey. The matrix approach thus is useful for evaluation of existing training courses or establishment of training levels for new courses.

6.33

KIRKPATRICK DONALD L. Evaluating Training Programs:
Evidence vs. Proof

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 31(11) November 1977 pp.9-12

The four stages of evaluation process - reaction, learning, behaviour and results - are analysed in terms of evidence vs. proof. The author suggests that trainers should work hard to gather proof of effectiveness of programs and be cautious in sharing only evidence which is much easier to obtain than proof. On the other hand, if proof is either impossible or at least impractical, trainers should be satisfied with evidence.

6.34

KIRKPATRICK DONALD L. Evaluating In-House Training Programs

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 32(8) September 1978 pp.6-9

The article concentrates on evaluating a supervisory training program and provides guidelines for evaluating learning. The problem of measuring changes in on-the-job behaviour is a challenge to the trainer as it involves outside classroom effort. The most difficult stage of evaluation is to determine what final results were accomplished because of the training program. By using tangible data a trainer can measure the conditions before the program and compare with the conditions after the program.

6.35

KIRKPATRICK D.L. **Evaluation of Training Programmes**

American Society for Training and
Development

Wisconsin, Ma.

(USA)

1975

pp.313

This book is a compilation of articles and research reports on evaluation of training programmes written on the basis of evaluation attempts of programmes conducted by universities, management institutes and companies located in different countries such as US, UK and India. The author contends that though evaluation results cannot be borrowed from other organisations, evaluation methods and procedures can be borrowed and used. Accordingly, the articles included in the book are expected to help the readers and trainers to read, comprehend and then refine these techniques to suit one's individual needs. The book is broadly in five parts: Techniques for evaluating training programmes, Reaction, Learning and Behavior. Parts II to V present a collection of articles pertaining to the relevant steps in evaluation. Each part exposes the trainer to the various techniques of evaluation and the particular factors which need to be probed into.

6.36

KUMAR USHA

Evaluation of Training Programmes in the
Paradigm of Research

ASCI Journal of Management

Hyderabad

(India)

5(2)

March 1976

pp.139-143

The problems in evaluation are examined in the background of four main issues: (a) Goal attainment model of training and evaluation; (b) Purpose of evaluating training programmes; (c) Methodology of evaluation; and (d) Organisational context of evaluation. It is explained that utilization of evaluation findings may depend upon the manner in which the results are reported. The involvement of individuals at different levels in understanding the training evaluation results may help in the incorporation of research findings that recommend further changes and refinement in the subsequent training programmes. In the final analysis, the usefulness of evaluation depends upon the acceptance of the findings for future training activity and in the increased understanding of human and organisational functioning.

6.38

KOHN VERA (comp) **A Selected Bibliography on Evaluation of Management Training and Development Programs**

American Foundation for Management Research New York
(USA) 1969 pp.25

The book contains 61 items published between 1959 and early 1969. Five categories covered include research studies, literature reviews, discussion of evaluation techniques, surveys of corporate practices and books. Aspects covered are participant satisfaction, interpersonal competence, sensitivity and human relations training, program planning, behaviour and attitude change, reinforcement and managerial grid.

6.39

LIEN ARNOLD J. **Measurement and Evaluation of Learning**

Wm. C. Brown Co. Dubuque, Is.
(USA) 1967 pp.220

The book attempts to acquaint the reader with the measurement and evaluation phase of the threefold tasks: Where am I going? How am I going to get there? How well have I and my students arrived? Once an explanation of the tasks is understood, the remainder of the book moves into the practical aspects of measurement and evaluation. The book is organised in four parts: Part One deals with foundations of measurement and evaluation, Part Two with techniques of measurement, Part Three with presentation and analysis of data collected through measurement and Part Four discusses the application of measurement and evaluation.

6.40

LESTER RICHARD I. **Criteria for Evaluating Training Materials**

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 25(8) August 1971 pp.12-15

A checklist for objective assessment is provided and trainers are urged to give preference to 'objective evidence' in selecting instructional material. A set of eleven criteria are suggested as a guide. These include subject matter content, organisation, self-instructional aids, adaptability, costs and general evaluation.

6.41

LIPPITT GORDON L. **Criteria for Evaluating Human Resource Development**

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 30(10) October 1976 pp.3-10

The purpose of the paper is to present the need for stated criteria for planning and evaluating the process of human resource development concerned at the level of individual, group, organisation and society. Concepts and methods to produce evaluation are outlined based on information system, organisation support and participant commitment.

6.42

MAANEN JOHN VAN **The Process of Program Evaluation**

National Training and Development Service Press Washington, D.C.
(USA) 1973 pp.79

The book provides the training administrator with the tools to conduct more than narrow variety of evaluation. The author takes the position that seldom can one be certain a change was brought about by a specific program. Evaluation is viewed, therefore, as beginning with a rough conception of what is going on and concluding with a set of grounded recommendations. The strategy proposed in the book assumes that the objective of the evaluator is to help decision-makers develop the best program possible. The chapters include Evaluation Model, Evaluation Questions, Measurement Issues, and the Program Setting.

6.43

MANSFIELD R. **Case Study in the Evaluation of Management Education**

Management Education & Development Lancaster
(UK) 5(1) 1974 pp.7-16

The author is concerned with the reasons for doing evaluation of management development programmes, the methods by which it may be done and the criteria to be analysed. These reasons are analysed. A case study of an evaluation effort is presented which is based on selected criteria. The three criteria discussed are attitude change, development of self-confidence and subjective assessment of participants.

6.44

MINDAK WILLIAM A. Can We Quantify an Act of Faith?
& ANDERSON
ROBERT E.

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 25(5) May 1971 pp.2-9

Based on considering employees as assets and part of a systems approach for management training, a methodology is outlined for a pilot study in evaluation. Several implications and conclusions are reported. These include (i) management training can be quantified and measured by use of such tests as the semantic differential and the social perception analysis, (ii) changes in attitude come about not only from instruction but also from experience working with key concepts, and (iii) shifts in attitude were for the most part shortlived when executives returned to their companies.

6.45

MORANO RICHARD Measurement and Evaluation of Training

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 29(7) July 1975 pp.42-47

The problem of evaluation is to define the measurement criteria for (a) evaluating courses of instruction from an education point of view, and (b) evaluating programs from an organisation point of view. Training needs have to be determined and the author suggests a matrix involving four keys steps. Also recommended is a counselling mechanism to screen the right people into the program adjusted against enrolment trends.

6.46

MORRISEY GEORGE Supervisory Training Can be Measured
L. & WELLSTEAD 'Objectively' on the Job
WILLIAM R.

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 25(6) 1971 pp.12-14

The authors feel that at the end of a supervisory training programme, the trainee must himself commit to specific objectives on how he will apply some of what he has learned. A chronological checklist of implementing the approach is outlined. The real purpose is to get participants to make a written commitment to improvement action, whatever its nature.

6.47

O.E.C.D.

**Evaluation of Supervisory and Management
Training Methods**

O.E.C.D.

Paris

(France)

1962

pp.159

An outcome of an international project attended by eight European countries and five international organisations, the report is among the earliest publication on the problem of the evaluation of training. The discussion includes the general framework of the evaluation of training, the difficulties of evaluation, and the history of evaluation of training including project notes by eight member institutes. Part II deals with the technical questions of evaluation with special emphasis on training objectives and evaluation instruments. Part III surveys the evaluation performed by member institutes and Part IV outlines some methodological considerations concerning the evaluation of training.

6.48

PARKER T.C.

**Evaluating: The Forgotten Finale of
Training**

Personnel

New York

(USA)

5(6)

1973

pp.59-63

The evaluation of any training must be done against the objectives of the training programme. However, it is not the only factor to be evaluated. Four categories are involved in the evaluation: job performance, group performance, participant satisfaction, and participant knowledge gain. After the selection of criteria of evaluation from the above, some technique such as questionnaire, job sample test, visual observation, rating forms etc. can be selected depending upon the suitability. And, whatever be the view of training, it must be as an investment and not as a cost factor.

6.49

PARKINS C.R.

**Evaluation: Problems and Possibilities
for the Training Profession**

I.S.T.D. Review

Delhi

(India)

2(3-4)

1972

pp.102-7

The question of evaluation is pointed out as the most significant issue confronting the trainer and the training profession as it rightly forms a part of

administrative/management and organisational development. Evaluation is analysed not only as a post-training exercise but as a process which must be integrated with the total training experience. Finally, a plea is made for more extensive use of social and behavioral science methods and data which could give an empirical base to the assessment of training.

6.50

PATTERSON WALTER
L. et al A Practical Approach to the Analysis
of TEOT Data

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 28(12) December 1974 pp.32-36

A practical approach to analyse training evaluation of the work of training data is suggested on two counts: quality of the TEOT data and the analyses performed on these data. The reported study indicates that the management of its training effort has been enhanced by the analysis of the TEOT data collected.

6.51

PETER WARR et al **Evaluation of Management Training**

Gower Press London
(UK) 1979 pp.111

It is stressed that evaluation will provide trainers with information that will enable to increase the effectiveness of later or even current training. The book is set out in three parts. In the first part some theoretical considerations are outlined along with an account of a generalised framework for describing training evaluation. Part two presents thirteen case studies about the training of junior and middle managers. These are all evaluation projects with which the authors have been directly associated. The last part considers some of the more general issues raised by the need to evaluate training. The book gives useful advice about the construction and use of questionnaires, since trainers have limited experience in questionnaire design.

6.52

PRAHLAD C.K. Measurement of Training Effectiveness:
A Quantitative Approach

Economic & Political Weekly Bombay
(India) 7(48) pp.M169-M178

The paper attempts to introduce a quantitative approach to the evaluation of training effectiveness by classifying the total training effort into Action and Developmental training. A present-value approach is developed to evaluate Action Training projects. Human Resource Accounting concepts have been extended to evaluate the impact of Developmental Training. A procedure is also evolved for capitalising investments in training.

6.53

REEVES ELTON T.& Effectiveness of Program Evaluation
JENSEN MICHAEL J.

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 26(2) January 1972 pp.36-41

The study reports on evidence about verification of participant evaluation. This will include (i) whether the evaluation of identical programs by separate groups of participants with similar educational needs are comparable, (ii) if the participants' evaluation is transitory, are the participants' evaluations a function of time, and (iii) whether the institution's evaluations of its own programs are compatible with those of the participants. The results indicate that participants' evaluation could be effective in refinement of later programs.

6.54

REYNOLDS M. Effect of Training Interventions on
Management Relationships

European Training Bradford
(UK) 1(1) 1972 pp.68-75

The author investigates the training variable in the scheme of relationships and discusses how much effective collaboration takes place in an organisation as a function of the balance between various aspects of the human relationships involved. It is suggested that a training intervention may upset the balance more than might have been thought beforehand. The paper describes

two cases to illustrate the problem and its significance for management training. The intervention, it is indicated, effects the balance at the interface between hierarchy levels in the organisation.

6.55

UNIVERSITY OF
GHANA

Training Evaluation Survey

Greenhill Journal of Administration

Achimota

(Ghana)

1(2)

1974

pp.38-59

This is a research report evaluating the training imparted to participants in Greenhill programmes between 1970 and 1973. The study had four objectives which are analysed in two parts: Employer's Evaluation and Participant's Evaluation. The participant's evaluation focussed on general views on training benefits and standard of the course, course content and training methods, choice of subjects and finally facilities and technical arrangements. The study revealed that formal post-training job evaluation is almost a far cry in many public institutions. It would be desirable for employers and heads of departments to institute formal evaluation procedures to evaluate all training courses attended by their employees.

6.56

ROY S.K. &
DOLKE A.M.

Evaluation of a Supervisory Training
Programme

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

25(12)

December 1971

pp.35-39

The paper - a study of training effectiveness in selected textile mills in India - seeks to examine the key evaluation factor like reaction, learning, validity, reliability, participation and learning, and achievement motivation and learning. It is concluded that in spite of the obvious and fundamental need to evaluate aspects of training programs, trainers feel shy of the task. Trainers have to be careful to plan evaluation before the program and not to hunt for data after it is all over.

6.57

SCHWARZ PAUL A. **Ability Testing in Developing Countries -**
& KRUG ROBERT E. **A Handbook of Principles and Techniques**

Praeger Publishers

London

(UK)

1972

pp.245

The book, an outcome of extended research in different countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America, outlines various aspects of testing in four main elements: basic issues, techniques of test adaptation, practical test applications and developing local testing resources. The concept is extended even to include programs of reform in a developing country, and as a reference manual to be consulted selectively at various stages of implementation. The areas discussed in detail include abilities to be measured, the design of suitable tests and the design of effective testing procedures.

6.58

SMITH MIKE

Using Repertory Grid to Evaluate Training

Personnel Management

London

(UK)

10(2)

February 1978

pp.36-43

A case is described about the application of repertory grid to evaluate training. It is a flexible technique and can be used to evaluate the effects of training on a single individual, and in higher management it could be a tool for management development. There are several clear advantages. First, there is less susceptibility to bias than traditional attitude measures. Repertory grid techniques do not suggest the questions, let alone the answers. Secondly, the statistical procedures are so sophisticated that it is doubtful if, under normal circumstances, it is humanly possible to fake the answers. Thirdly, the results are not a series of tables and abstractions. These advantages need to be outweighed against the main disadvantage: the reliance on a computer.

6.59

STEEL MUNRO H. An Organised Evaluation of Management Training

Personnel Journal Swarthmore, Pa.
(USA) 51(10) October 1972 pp.723-727

Training programs cost money. The usual system requiring the participant to fill out a form at the end of the program hardly constitutes a sufficient evaluation of the program. It is only logical to analyse how participants succeed or fail in paying off in terms of improved job performance. The evaluation effort has to be built in the program. The author has emphasised measuring the learning and change in behaviour. Some guideposts for evaluating behaviour are outlined.

6.60

STEINER RICHARD New Uses for Assessment Centers - Training Evaluation

Personnel Journal Santa Monica
(USA) 54(4) April 1976 pp.236-248

It is argued that if trainers are unable to make their impact explicit and measurable, then on what basis can they ask for resources? One may also wonder whether training practitioners are able to justify programs and efforts at developing employee potential if one never knows whether or not better performance actually resulted. In this context, the concept of an assessment center is conceptualised as a training vehicle. Research indicates that participants view the assessment process as a learning experience. This is a logical outcome because most assessment materials and assessor training techniques are based on tried and true training methodology. Finally, the center can be used as a highly accurate means for evaluating executive development or other types of training programs. The paper explains how a trainer can successfully incorporate the concept into an overall training evaluation strategy.

6.61

STEINER RICHARD & KELLY FRANK A Key Factors Approach to Assessing Management Development

Personnel Journal Santa Monica
(USA) 55(7) July 1976 pp.358-362

There has been a failure to adequately evaluate the impact of management development programs. The authors approach the problem by studying the relationships between participant characteristics and programmatic factors and relate these to measures of overall course reaction. The five indicators of course success were based on participant rating of course impact on specific plans to solve problems, impact on general knowledge level, recommendations to peers, subordinates and superiors, whether the course was worth the time and whether it met initial expectations. It is indicated that evidence probably supports the conclusion that those volunteering to attend find the course upto expectations. Some major implications for future research are suggested.

6.62

STEVENS B. **Weighing Up Training**

Industrial Society London
(UK) 54 April 1972 pp.10-11

The experience of three organisations in the successful evaluation of management development training is noted. The main principles of evaluation in these cases included a written target setting by the superior of the potential trainee, a written plan of action by the trainee at the end of a course and finally an evaluation by the trainee as to how far the needs have been met. It is concluded that implementation of these principles will facilitate the process of evaluation.

6.63

THOMPSON JOHN T. How to Develop a More Systematic Evaluation Strategy

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
(USA) 32(2) February 1978 pp.88-93

A model for developing a strategy for evaluation is outlined. It lists six major concerns - the audience, criteria of evaluation, validity concerns, methods, designs and problem areas. The trainer faces specific problems in these areas, especially the organisational,

decision makers. The trainer has to ask the question, 'what do I want to measure and to evaluate?' The use of the model can provide a method for the trainer to develop a balanced strategy to bridge the gap between evaluation theory and evaluation in an action setting.

6.64

TAYLOR LAWRENCE

Evaluation of the Administrative Training Programmes in the Southern Sudan 1975-77

Journal of Administration Overseas

London

(UK)

XVII(3)

1978

pp.168-176

The evaluation of Junior Administrator's Training Course is described, the material for which was drawn from five separately identified categories of informants. These groups included senior officials within the regional governments, upper middle-level line managers who had been supervisors of several ex-trainees, cross section of ex-trainees who had performed well and less well and finally the observations of the author. The methodology also involved field visits to a number of administrative offices. The resulting evaluation suggested that the programme had a number of shortcomings. Future training needs had to be established and analysed. These steps could lead to options and priorities for future assistance.

6.65

THORLEY STAN

Training Supervisors and the Cascade Effect

Personnel Management

London

(UK)

10(4)

April 1978

pp.45-47

A training kit for hospital supervisors was launched and later evaluated. The result has been a substantial increase in technical knowledge by the supervisors and a progressive development of their skills. The evaluation included before and after questionnaires, briefing, reaction scale, assessment of students and interview schedules. These instruments produced an evaluation matrix including level, technique and group. The evaluation has shown the scheme to be a worthwhile exercise but it has created expectation of further training and development which, if not pursued, may result in disillusionment and a deterioration in morale.

6.66

TRACEY WILLIAM R. **Training Evaluation - Another Perspective**

Personnel Management

London

(UK)

9(3)

March 1977

pp.28-31

The author stresses that evaluation is an essential activity and must be a part of every well-designed training programme. All forms of evaluation, immediate, intermediate and ultimate should be included. Basic principles of evaluation should be systematically applied. If these steps are taken, the training and development activity will become indispensable because of its ability to demonstrate positive effects. The variables mentioned in measures of evaluation include trainees, trainers and supervisors, management and the enterprise climate. Some ultimate measures of training are identified.

6.67

TRICE HARRISON M. **Evaluation of Training: Strategy,**
& ROMAN PAUL M. **Tactics and Problems**

A.S.T.D.

Madison, Wis

(USA)

1973

pp.49

Basic questions in training evaluation strategy are examined. Following this is a consideration of six approaches whereby evaluative questions may be posed including assumptions, advantages and disadvantages. The tactics of evaluation of training efforts and the basis for choosing different tactical approaches are discussed along with recent trends in training evaluation.

6.68

WEISS CAROL H. **Evaluation Research**

Prentice-Hall

Englewood Cliffs

(USA)

1972

pp.160

Designed as a basic text in courses on evaluation research, it discusses the purposes and design of evaluation, and utilization of evaluation results. Sections on Evaluator's role and Formulating the question and measuring the answer have relevance for trainers.

6.69

UNITED NATIONS

'Methods and Problems of Evaluating Programs
for the Development of Senior Administrators'
in **Report of the Interregional Seminar on the
Development of Senior Administrators in the
Public Service of Developing Countries,**
Geneva, August 1968

Report and Technical Papers Vol. I

New York

(USA)

1969

The purpose of the paper is to present some of the methods and problems of evaluating programs for the development of senior administrators. Three aspects of the subject are discussed: the concept of evaluation, the problems involved and the methods so far developed. Finally, the importance of evaluation is discussed. It is noted that evaluation offers protection against uninformed attacks on programs and it should not be neglected because there are neither recognised methods nor easy answers to the problems which it presents. Finally, objectives on which evaluation is based should be derived from specific and differentiated development needs and should be tailored to fit the environment of work.

6.70

WEREKO T.B.

Training - A Dilemma? (How to Increase
Training Effectiveness)

Greenhill Journal of Administration

Achimota

(Ghana)

1(3)

1974

pp.65-79

It is the contention of this paper that there is an essential spadework that must be done at five levels, by the Director of Training, the trainee's immediate supervisor, the trainee, the top management as well as the training institution concerned with training before anyone is sent on training. The author examines the objectives of training in Ghana, and describes the performance of the training institutions and the training techniques used. There is reference to determining training needs leading to choice of a useful training programme and learning on the course. It is only after these steps have been completed that management can accept training not only as necessary but beneficial.

6.71

WERNHAM R.

Getting the Measuring of Management
Training

Personnel Management

London

(UK)

4(3)

1972

pp.28-31

The need for evaluation of management training is discussed. The author describes evaluation techniques for management training courses developed by him and practically used in the Telecommunications Technology College of the British Post Office. The author has relied on four levels of evaluation: reaction, learning, job behaviour and functioning, as framework for his technique. The aspect of training costs in evaluation is also noted.

6.72

WHITELAW MATT

The Evaluation of Management Training -
A Review

The Institute of Personnel Management

London

(UK)

1972

pp.63

The evaluation of management training is beset by problems of definition and measurement, and the author feels that it is probably not possible in the great majority of cases to demonstrate its value in accounting terms. It is explained that in spite of lack of sophistication at this stage of development, we should do what we can at a level where we can visibly improve the quality of the training and demonstrate its value in terms of increased effectiveness. The concept, history and difficulties in evaluation of management training are discussed and the methods are illustrated by studies involving their use with emphasis on methodology rather than results. Intermediate outcome evaluation as a possible evaluation is indicated.

6.73

WITHANA
RANJITH M.

Evaluation of Administrative Training -
Some Training Experiences

Journal of Development Administration

Colombo

(Sri Lanka)

4(1)

May 1974

pp.51-69

In Sri Lanka the Academy of Administrative Studies was established in 1966. The author attempts to indicate the position and significance of evaluation in the network of activities comprising the overall training function: the limitations and difficulties in assessing the impact of

training on the administration; the approaches in evaluating specific training programmes and the experiences of the Academy in this direction. A schematic model is presented to indicate the desirable links and the interrelationship of evaluation with the other activities. Also discussed are two of the course evaluations carried out at the Academy - the Management Development Course 1972 and the Seminar on Management Development for Senior Scientific and Technical Administrators 1973.