

Section A

Annotated Bibliography

1.

ABBATIELLO
AURELIUS, A.

An objective Evaluation of Attitude Change in Training

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Nov. 1967

pp.9

This is a report on an attempt to measure attitudinal change by use of the Semantic Differential technique of Osgood et al (1957). The technique may be of value to trainers with a psychological background.

2.

ALDEN JAY

Evaluation in Focus

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Oct. 1978

pp.5

An article by a practising evaluator which focusses on the kinds of questions which should be asked once it has been agreed that evaluation should take place. It also deals with the level of data and the decision making criteria. A useful article for all training evaluators.

3.

ALLINSON C.W.

Training in Performance Appraisal Interviewing:
An Evaluation Study

Journal of Management Studies

XIV

1977

pp.12

This paper describes in detail a study of the effects of a training course in performance appraisal interviewing. It covers sample and research design; data collection; analysis and results; communication; obtaining information; atmosphere and rapport; organizing and conducting. It could prove a useful model for trainers.

4.

ANAND K.K.

Evaluation of Training

Indian Management

(India) 11(6)

pp.9

Cost benefit analysis of training is important from two points of view: firstly, training as a specialist function cannot grow unless its activities are subjected to a cost-benefit analysis; secondly, cost-benefit analysis will provide necessary feed-back about the utilization of resources allocated to the training function. An initial step in cost-benefit analysis of training is the identification of costs which are amenable to quantification in monetary terms. An analytical approach developed in an Indian company is described.

5.

ANDREWS K.R.

The Effectiveness of University Management Development Programs

Harvard

(USA)

1966

pp.340

This book by a former Professor of Business Administration at Harvard University reports in detail on the analysis of a questionnaire survey of 1000 businessmen who attended management development courses at 39 management schools in the United States. It goes into exhaustive detail over the origin and education of the students, their reactions to the programmes, the impact and consequences of the programmes and the implications for university and company action.

The main use of the book will be for any trainer or organisation wishing to conduct a similar widespread exercise. The appendix reproduces the 16-page questionnaire and has some notes on methodology.

3.

6.

ARMENAKIS A. &
SMITH L.

A Practical Alternative to Comparison Group Designs
in OD Evaluations - the Abbreviated Time Series Design

Academy of Management Journal

21

1978

pp.9

This is a research oriented work which may be useful for trainers with some education in psychology. It proposes an alternative (ASTD) to comparison group designs in evaluation and shows that ASTD is more effective than a one group pretest-posttest design.

7.

ARMENAKIS A.,
FIELD H.S. &
MOSLEY D.C.

Evaluation Guidelines for the OD Practitioner

Personnel Journal

Feb. 1975

pp.5

This article by 3 academic researchers reports on a survey of American OD practitioners regarding how they evaluated OD programmes. It sets out the most common evaluation practices, the types of criteria used and guidelines for evaluation practices. Still a valid article for a survey of normal practice.

8.

ASHTON D. &
GIBBON B.

Evaluating a Training Programme in the Probation
Service

European Training

3(1)

1974

pp.13

A useful report on the practices and problems of evaluating a management course for the whole of the senior management of a governmental organization. It has examples of the questionnaires used and the rating scale. One of the results was an understanding by the training staff of the crucial importance of obtaining in a pre-course questionnaire a statement by each individual about his course attendance objectives.

9.

ASHTON D. &
EASTERBY -SMITH M.

Management Development in the Organization

Macmillan

London

(UK)

1979

pp.120

An attempt to take a comprehensive view of management development in the organization. The book is concerned to focus on the effects of management training on managers' performances in the organization and further to a concern with the assessment of the systems of management development in an organization.

It covers management development in both the public and private sectors, the former with particular reference to local government, develops a framework for management development systems and has 15pp on how to audit management development systems. This includes but goes beyond the evaluation of training courses and is based on a modern systems framework.

10.

BAKKEN DAVID &
BERNSTEIN ALAN L.

A Systematic Approach to Evaluation

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Aug. 1982

pp.8

A simplistic approach to training evaluation which simply puts forward yet again the well-worn rules for simple evaluations. The title is rather pretentious.

11.

BARE C.E. &
MITCHELL R.R.

Experimental Evaluation of Sensitivity Training

Journal of Applied Behavioural Science

(USA)

8(3)

pp.14

The results of a laboratory experiment undertaken to (a) determine whether significant behavioural changes occur as a result of sensitivity training, and (b) compare the effectiveness of three sensitivity training groups, showed that experimental subjects reflected more rated behavioural change than did control group subjects at the conclusion of training and after a three months' follow-up period. The data also indicated that the combination pattern of time was more effective than the spaced pattern but no inter-pattern differences were significant at the three months' follow-up.

12.

BELASCO J.A. &
TRICE H.M.

The Assessment of Change in Training and Therapy

McGraw Hill

New York

(USA)

1969

pp.166

This small book, unusually, attempts to show that the problems of assessing change in training and therapy are much the same. It covers the strategic problems of evaluation, therapy and training evaluations, the contaminants involved and the practical application. It gives a detailed example of evaluating supervisory training in an organization. The book is useful to the professional concerned with the study of evaluation but of much less value to the training officer.

13.

BLUMENFELD WARREN S. &
HOLLAND MAX G.

A Model for the Empirical Evaluation of Training Effectiveness

Personnel Journal

(USA)

50(8)

Aug. 1971

pp.4

The article is concerned with the quality of accountability evidence, specifically with (1) the demonstration of the effectiveness of training, and (2) the quality of the evidence to demonstrate that effectiveness. Training is concerned as learning and criterion of measurement as part of experimental design are outlined. It is explained that a design without pretest and posttest does not generate evidence of behaviour change, and a design without a control group does not generate evidence of the extent to which any measured, behaviour change might have been caused by the training. A design lacking in either of these two characteristics is not quality evidence.

14.

BOLDA R.A. &
LAWSHE C.H.

Evaluation of Role Playing

Personnel Administration

(USA)

25(2)

1962

pp.3

The results of this study were (1) role playing can be effective in increasing sensitivity and in producing more adequate actions in human relations training (2) it is necessary that role playing provide an impact experience which (a) allows the trainee to criticize his own performance (b) provides him with adequate feedback (c) emphasizes a particular facet of human relations skill in a strong, emotional manner. Results indicated no particular aversion to role playing.

15.

BRANDENBURG DALE C. Training Evaluation - What's the Current Status?
 Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
 (USA) Aug. 1982 pp.5

If you want to know how in 1982 a representative sample of American trainers viewed and used evaluation this is an interesting article. It showed clearly that most trainers use unscientific techniques mainly to get feedback to improve their training while the least used techniques are those that require longitudinal studies.

16.

BRETHOWER K.S. & Evaluating Training
 RUMMLER G.A. Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis
 (USA) May 1979 pp.9

This very useful article is based on viewing training as a system. It puts forward and illustrates an Evaluation Matrix which can usefully be used by most trainers. It also deals with the difficulties encountered by evaluators in the "real" world.

17.

BROWN GERALD R. A Model for Post Course Evaluation
 Canadian Training Methods
 Feb. 1976 pp.2

This brief article is useful for the design (shown) of the evaluation form to be sent to the participants some time after the conclusion of the programme when they have had a chance to try out ideas on techniques learnt. It is in the form of a matrix with techniques on the left and 7 stages of adoption at the top.

18.

BUNKER K.A. &
COHEN S.L.The Rigors of Training Evaluation - a Discussion
and Field Demonstration

Personnel Psychology

(USA) 30(4) Winter 1977 pp.16

The report of an extended control group evaluation study of a basic electrical training programme for telephone installers using self pacing multi media techniques. The classic Solomon 4 group model was used and the evaluation of the one week course was spread over seven weeks. The report is useful for trainers with some psychological background and shows that extended control designs can be cost effective.

19.

BUNKER K.A. &
COHEN S.L.Evaluating Organisational Training Efforts: Is
Ignorance Really Bliss?

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis

(USA) Aug. 1978 pp.8

Bunker and Cohen consider the question of "Why evaluate?" and then go on to stress the need for a "true" experimental design. They report the result of an evaluation based on the Solomon model and its implication for organizational training evaluation.

20.

BUNKER K.A. &
COHEN S.L.

Evaluating Organisational Training Efforts

Training and Development Journal Madison, Wis

(USA) 32(8) Aug. 1978

The article seeks to offer some possible explanations for the existing inadequacies in most training evaluations. In view of the implications it is not surprising that training personnel are hesitant to undertake evaluation efforts that might appear to invalidate one's own developmental activities. Further, the evaluation process itself can sometimes jeopardize the internal validity of the training through pretest effects. Accordingly, the implications for organizational training evaluation are stated for the trainer.

21.

BURGOYNE JOHN G. &
COOPER C.L.

Evaluation Methodology

Journal of Occupational Psychology

(UK)

48(1)

1975

pp.10

A routine paper on training methodology which deals with the function and purpose of evaluation research; values; philosophical assumptions and theoretical frameworks and methodological considerations. It points out that the major problem in evaluation is that usually there is no clear specification by those responsible for training of what the desired outcomes or behaviours are and, as a result, endless time is spent considering behavioural criterion measures.

22.

BURGOYNE JOHN G.

An Action Research Experiment in the Evaluation of
a Management Development Course

Journal of Management Studies

(UK)

X

1973

pp.7

This is a report of an evaluation attempt at Manchester Business School using "nested" action research. The researcher worked with faculty to try to formulate what the participants were trying to learn and to develop a performance-related index. The latter proved intractable and the final index chosen was participants' perceptions of what they had learnt. The conclusions were (1) there was a benefit from stimulating the teaching staff to think about the rationale of their work (2) there was a contribution to evaluation theory (3) the technique can be viewed as a general technique for improving management development programmes.

23.

BURGOYNE JOHN G.

Course Conundrums

Personnel Management

(UK)

2

1970

pp.2

A plea for trainers to be given the task of evaluating external courses. Trainers are seen as (1) being more likely to have the knowledge and expertise to carry out useful evaluation (2) having access to much more relevant information than management.

24.

BURGOYNE JOHN G.

A New Approach to Evaluating Management Development
Programmes - Some Exploratory Research

Personnel Review

(UK)

Autumn 1973

pp.5

Evaluation research, rather than looking for relationships between treatment, learning and other consequences, must be concerned with how managers manage their own learning and derive a methodology for observing how any particular manager is doing it. Evaluation research should be concerned to help answer the questions (1) how do managers manage their own learning? (2) how should they manage their own learning? (3) how can they be helped to manage their own learning better? The author develops a conceptual framework based upon an Information Processing Approach.

25.

BURGOYNE J.G. &
SINGH R.

Evaluation of Training and Education

Journal of European Industrial Training

(UK)

1 (1)

1977

pp.5

This is a largely theoretical article which comes to five conclusions (1) any evaluation project should be clear about whether it is interested in departmental or organizational or societal consequences (2) an evaluation should be clear about whether the information it is generating is for "here and now" or future decisions (3) the evaluation project should know if it is aiming at policy, strategy, programme or method decisions (4) evaluation studies should embrace an integrated micro-macro approach (5) in particular evaluation should be concerned with behaviour change.

26.

BURGOYNE JOHN G.

An Action Research Experiment in the Evaluation of
a Management Development Course

Journal of Management Studies

X

1973

pp.6

An interesting short descriptive article building on the work of Rackham et al and Warr et al to show how an action research evaluation was carried out at the Manchester Business School on staff and students of a 12 week management course. The weakness of the experiment was that it depended for its results on the perceived learning changes by staff and students.

27.

BURGOYNE JOHN G. Judgment Process in Management Students' Evaluation of Their Learning Experiences

Human Relations

(USA) 28(6) 1975 pp.27

Several management development evaluation studies rely on the compilation, after the programme, of evaluation opinions from the participants. This research investigates the process of judgment underlying the formation of evaluative opinions by programme participants. The methodology of 'practical analysis', used so far mainly in laboratory studies is employed. The results show that a certain amount of validity can be attached to opinion-based follow-up studies, and that there is the possibility of designing such studies to improve the validity of the conclusions.

28.

CALDWELL LYNTON K. Measuring and Evaluating Personnel Training

Public Personnel Review

(USA) April 1964 pp.6

This is an older article which sets out the bases of evaluation. It discriminates between measurement and evaluation, discusses the pitfalls in measuring results and deals with criteria.

29.

CHAPMAN R.S. Selecting the Most Appropriate Evaluation Design for Management and Development Courses

European Training

(UK) 1(3) pp.9

There are three basic evaluation designs used in current evaluation research differentiated by the degree of thoroughness involved. But before the design can be chosen it must be clear whether the objectives of the management development are individual objectives, organizational objectives or environmental objectives.

30.

CHRISTOPHER K.J.

Evaluation of Training - A Few Considerations and
an Experience in

I.S.T.D. Review

(India) 2(3-4) 1972 pp.11

It is argued, on the basis of experience, that it is possible to evaluate changed behaviour of participants in their work situations both in quantitative and qualitative terms. A summary of such an evaluation carried out at a Central Training Institute in Hyderabad is reported. This evaluation was from the participants, from their superiors, peers and subordinates. The author feels that given proper attention, evaluation studies can be designed by trainers.

31.

CIVIL SERVICE
DEPARTMENT

Evaluation of Training in the Civil Service - a Survey

Civil Service Department London

(UK) 1977 pp.126

This is an unusual publication with many examples of evaluation questionnaires from the major ministries of the British Civil Service both administrative and technical. They cover most of the fields of training activity from induction to management. A useful work for trainers looking for ideas and comparisons.

32.

CLAYCOMBE W.W.

An Evaluation of Supervisory Skills to Determine
Training Needs in

Personnel Journal

(USA) 55(3) Mar. 1976 pp.5

The exercise was based on an initial evaluation of supervisory skills through four forms: supervisory evaluation form, the self-evaluation form, the supervisory interview form and the time percentage form. These forms were accompanied by detailed instructions. In the study under reference, training needs were clearly indicated in personal communication with emphasis on motivation. There was a general weakness in recognition of accomplishment. A profile of training needs was thus evolved.

33.

CLEMENT RONALD W. &
ARANDA EILEEN K.Evaluating Management Training - a Contingency
Approach

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Aug. 1982

pp.5

A modern approach to evaluation which takes into account the variables within the organization (the organizational setting, the nature of the manager to the trained, the problem to be solved through training) and has included a contingency framework for evaluation. This has four dimensions and can be used by both the trainer and the participant.

34.

CLEMENT RONALD W.

Testing the Hierarchy Theory of Training Evaluation -
an Expanded Role for Trainee Reactions

Public Personnel Management

(USA)

11(2)

Summer 1982

pp.9

A report on a test of the Kirkpatrick/Hamblin four level hierarchy model using a supervisory course with a control group for comparison. The results indicated the inadequacy of the received model and the author has produced a revised hierarchy which stresses environmental factors.

35.

COFFMAN L.

An Easy Way to Effectively Evaluate Program Results

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Aug. 1979

pp.5

An interesting and useful article which sets out a practical procedure by which the supervisors and managers, who are perceived as the clients of the training activities, are formally brought together in two sessions to develop opinions on the strengths and weaknesses of a programme. It is stressed that this technique can be threatening to the trainer(s) involved.

36.

COFFMAN L.

Successful Training Program Evaluation

Training and Development Journal

Madison, Wis

(USA)

Oct. 1980

pp.4

This is a follow up to the August 1979 article in T & D Journal describing an innovative approach to evaluation. The article describes workshops on the new approach, sets out how the evaluation may be used on other than training programmes and describes some minor modifications to the original procedure.

37.

COUCH PETER D. &
STROTHER GEORGE B.

A Critical Incident Evaluation of Supervisory Training

Training and Development Journal

25(9)

Sept. 1971

pp.6

The study suggests that classroom supervisory training has a broad positive impact in that it enables the individual to learn more from on-the-job experience than he would have without training. As an indirect evaluation of training, it focusses on the question of whether or not training makes people 'better learners about supervising'. The affirmative answer to this question has implications for the design and comprehensive supervisory development programs using both classroom and on-the-job experiences.

38.

COWELL DONALD W.

Evaluating the Effectiveness of Management Courses

European Training

(UK)

I(1)

Spring 1972

pp.13

The paper presents the conventional framework adopted by evaluation of management education programmes and examines by reference to then recent research some specific problems which can arise in applying such a framework in practice. The need for the evaluation of management education to assess its benefits for both individuals and organizations is stressed. It is concluded that the evaluation of management education should lead also to an improvement in the quality of evaluative tools and procedures available and to the more effective design of courses based upon a better understanding of the content and instructional methods suitable for management education.

39.

COWELL DONALD

Making Management Education Effective

Management Decision Monograph

13 (2)

1975

pp.39

The evaluation of the effectiveness of marketing courses has been much neglected. This monograph outlines a longitudinal investigation of four one week courses using the classic approach for studies of effectiveness and concluding three months after the participants returned to their jobs. In the discussion it points out that course effects cannot always be gauged precisely, that evaluation helps decision making about courses, that evaluation studies show the diversity of course impacts and that evaluation studies have a range of wide effects. Not least, the study found that course users and providers need to work together more closely to ensure that management courses have the greatest pay offs. A useful bibliography is appended.

40.

DAVIES I.K.

The Management of Learning

McGraw Hill

London

(UK)

1971

pp.256

This book represents a simple approach towards the technology of training. It is organised on the basis of sections dealing with planning, organizing, leading and controlling.

This last section contains two quite brief chapters on evaluating a learning course and measuring learning. Each is primarily directed towards non-managerial training.

41.

DEEMING BASIL S.

A System for Evaluating Training Programs

Personnel

56:33-41 Nov/Dec 1979

Using worksheet examples the article sets out ten steps to evaluation with the emphasis upon the Potential for Savings (PS). The emphasis is upon monetary cost savings based upon a relatively unsophisticated approach to evaluation. It views 10% of the cost of the training being evaluated as being the correct amount to spend on evaluation.

42.

DENOVA C.C.

Is This Any Way to Evaluate a Training Activity -
You Bet It Is

Personnel Journal

(US)

July 1968

pp.6

An article of considerable use to a trainer commencing evaluation. It gives the advantages and disadvantages of various types of objective tests, deals with programme evaluation and points out the difficulties. Not for the researcher or the experienced trainer.

43.

DENOVA C.C.

Test Construction for Training Evaluation

Van Nostrand Reinhold

New York

(USA)

1979

pp.118

The refinement of testing procedures in recent years has led to widespread use of testing devices in different categories of training programmes. The book emphasises practical applications rather than abstract management theory and offers essential procedures for selecting test terms, constructing different types of tests, using the tests to maximum advantage, administering the tests, and evaluating test results. The analysis is outlined from the viewpoint of the training staff and the trainer with guidelines for relevant implementation. It is explained how a test is a valuable tool when utilised in personnel training and development. Methods are discussed for designing essay, oral, true-false, multiple choice, matching, fill-in, and other types of tests.

44.

dePHILLIPS F.A.
ET AL

Management of Training Programs

Irwin

Homewood, Ill.

(USA)

1960

pp.60

This book is now dated and its emphasis is on private sector training but it is useful on techniques of research in training. It has little to say on the evaluation of managerial training but it is particularly useful on survey method and to a lesser degree on experimental method.

45.

DICKINSON A.W.

Effective Company Training

Longman

London

(UK)

1973

pp.242 (14pp
on evaluation)

As its name implies, this work is directed at the private sector and then mainly at lower level skills training. It is adequate in its sections dealing with clerical and commercial training, operator training and the training of apprentices and young people but is notably weak in the part dealing with management training.

The 14 pages devoted to the evaluation of all kinds of training is of some interest, particularly the three diagrammatic models covering respectively the circle of evaluation, the stages in the evolution of an evaluation instrument and the validation of training schemes through performance evaluations.

46.

DIGMAN LESTER A.

How Companies Evaluate Management Development Programs

Human Resource Management

Summer 1980

pp.4

In an attempt to survey how American business organizations actually evaluated management development programmes, the author obtained useful responses from 47 companies. The article summarizes the results which show that few organizations use vigorous evaluation techniques and most use relatively simple ones such as participant surveys, usually by questionnaire or personal interview.

47.

DONALD ARCHIE

Evaluating Middle Management and Supervisory Training

Management Education and Development

(UK)

1(2)

Dec. 1970

pp.10

The requirement of a stated goal for a particular phase of training is fundamental to its subsequent evaluation. To evaluate effectiveness requires (1) a job specification to give information on the skills and knowledge required (2) a measure of how far existing managers and supervisors already have such skills and knowledge that are related to job performance. The key difficulty is in measuring work behaviour. The paper deals briefly with attempts to measure behavioural change.

48.

DONALDSON L. &
SCANNELL E.E.

Human Resource Development

Addison-Wesley

Reading, Mass

(USA)

1978

pp.151

Donaldson and Scannell have written a short down-to-earth book designed to help new trainers avoid many pitfalls but they have succeeded in producing a text which is also very useful for experienced training officers.

In thirteen chapters it covers the fields of developing people, designing effective training programmes, determining needs and objectives, learning and motivation theory, methods of instruction, meeting conduct and evaluation.

In seventeen pages on evaluation it covers ground common to many other texts but it also contains "an eight-step system for evaluating results" which should be very useful even for those experienced in training.

49.

DRESSEL PAUL L.

Handbook of Academic Evaluation

Jossey-Bass Publishers

London

(UK)

1976

pp.518

The author presents a complete analysis of all phases of evaluation - from formulating objectives, determining costs, and collecting data to measuring programme and institutional success, identifying undesirable effects and recommending change. He shows how shifts in resource allocation, revised institutional priorities, and improved teaching and learning can result from evaluation; how evaluation can pinpoint future needs and appraise potentials. Part III relating to evaluation of programmes and personnel provides insight regarding curriculum and faculty.

50.

DROUET PIERRE

The Case for More Systematic Evaluation of Vocational Training Programmes

International Labour Review

102

1970

pp.20

A theoretical essay stressing the importance of evaluation not only for the training programme itself but also for intra-system "induced effects". Subjects covered are definitions, objectivity, appropriateness, effectiveness and a suggested evaluation method. It deals, in some detail, with intra-programme evaluation.

51.

DUBOIS PHILIP H.,
MAYO G &
DOUGLAS G (eds)

Research Strategies for Evaluating Training

American Ednl. Research Association

Washington, DC

(USA)

1971

pp.152

A collection of papers presented at several conferences to develop and test strategies for evaluating training. Part I covers basic issues in training research - learning ability, laboratory studies of learning, Part II the measuring of learning, the criterion problem, the unreliability of the measuring instrument, and Part III methods and results, correlational analysis and analysis of variance in training research, programmed instruction and the relationship between learning and intelligence.

52.

EASTERBY -SMITH
MARKThe Evaluation of Management Education and Development
- an Overview

Personnel Review

(UK) 10(2) 1981 pp.9

As conceptions of evaluation have developed over the past two decades they have also posed many more questions about the role and activity of evaluation. There are no longer any clear guidelines about the features of a "good" evaluation. This very useful article gives a summary of earlier evaluation practices and discusses recent approaches, particularly "goal-free" evaluation and "illuminative" evaluation. It also deals with the similarities and differences experienced in evaluation into educational and management training programmes.

53.

ELIASON A.L.

Study of the Effects of Quantitative Training

Academy of Management Journal

(USA) 15(2) 1972 pp.12

The study reports the results of a quantitative training exercise in which two groups of subjects, one with advanced quantitative training, the other with little or no quantitative training, were exposed to an interactive decision simulation gaming model to test, experimentally, possible effects of quantitative training. The findings show that the quantitative group achieved a higher level of game performance but were unable to justify why gaming decisions were necessary

54.

ELSEBREE A.R. &
HOWE C.

An Evaluation of Training in Three Acts

Training and Development Journal

Jul., Aug., pp.20
Sept. 1977

In a play form the authors portray a three part process for the evaluation of training programmes. In the focus phase the evaluator establishes the extent and objectives of the evaluation exercise. The blue-print for conducting the project is set out in the plan phase. During the implementation phase the evaluator puts the plan into action. The process is set out in a flow chart. The article is a dramatization with commentary and enables the reader to envisage how the process might be applied in a real situation.

55.

ENGEL H.M.

Evaluating Employee Development in K.T. Byers (ed)

Employee Training and Development in the Public Sector

Int. Pers. Man. Assocn.

Chicago

(USA)

1974

pp.24

There are comparatively few books aimed directly at training in the public sector and this one, which deals with the purposes of training, theory, methods and application, is of considerable value to all trainers working in this sector.

The twenty-four pages devoted to evaluating employee development deal with purposes and benefits, evaluation of the instructor as well as the trainee, questionnaires, post training conferences and less usual methods.

56.

FAST D.

A New Approach to Quantifying Training Program Effectiveness

Training and Development Journal

Sept. 1974

pp.7

This article, based on experience of training in U.S. life insurance offices, provides a new and simple approach to macro quantification of the results achieved in training. Participants assess effectiveness in terms of the degree to which their desires and expectations of the training were met. This is a simple approach which might be used as a supplement to the usual evaluation questionnaires.

57.

FAULEY F.E.

Developing a Better Survey Questionnaire

Training and Development Journal

Aug. 1972

pp.4

A useful short article which gives ways of improving questionnaires through both less structuring and high structuring.

58.

FAY P.P. &
BEACH D.N.

Management by Objectives Evaluated

Personnel Journal

Oct. 1974

pp.3

This brief paper is of value to trainers interested in using MBO and seeking evidence of validation. It reports on an evaluation study of a MBO programme and sets out usefully the study design and the results.

59.

FERENCE T.P. &
RITTI R.R.

Evaluating the Functions of Management Education

Personnel Journal

(USA)

Aug. 1970

pp.9

A sample of recent MBA graduates was asked to assess the impact of their graduate business training on their careers and evaluate their courses of study. With the continuing growth of MBA courses this is a useful example of how courses may be evaluated. It could be applied to other large scale management training programmes.

60.

FERGUSON WILBURN C.

Quantitative Evaluation of Training Using Student Reaction

Training and Development Journal

Nov. 1968

pp.6

This article presents a method for using the reaction of trainees to evaluate training. A four step method is used which depends upon keeping a careful record of absences and dropouts, determining the occupational group the course to be evaluated fits, determining a score for each of absences, dropouts and student ratings and finally add the three scores algebraically. The method is most successful when enrolment is voluntary.

61.

FERRARI SERGIO

The Open Problem of Management Training Evaluation

Management International Review

10

1970

pp.6

The author deals in general terms with the problems of evaluation. Areas covered in general terms are the objectives of a management training course, strategies of evaluation and the second level of evaluation. Objectives of courses and their evaluations are better established by managers themselves even if helped by social scientists in setting up more effective systems of measurement.

62.

FLODEN ROBERT E. &
WEINER STEPHEN S.Rationality to Ritual - the Multiple Roles of
Evaluation in Governmental Processes

Policy Sciences

9

1978

pp.9

Although its focus is on broad government programmes, this article is of relevance to all concerned with organizational development. It deals with the decision model, the goals, information and utilization premises and puts forward the view that evaluations often cannot perform the task of giving decision makers the information necessary for discrete decisions. It puts forward the view that evaluation is a means of conflict resolution, is a way of reducing complacency and is, finally, a necessary ritual.

63.

GHIRNIKAR L.N.

Evaluating Executive Development

I.S.T.D. Review

Delhi

(India)

2(1)

1972

pp.4

The author attempts to establish some key reasons for the failure of some executive development programmes. These include: unsuitable organizational climate, insufficient management commitment, executive trainee selection without proper scientific basis, lack of need-based training programmes. Individually as well as cumulatively, these reasons block the learning outcome of training programmes.

64.

GOLDSTEIN IRWIN L.

The Pursuit of Internal and External Validity in
the Evaluation of Training Programs

Public Personnel Management

8:416-429 Nov/Dec 1979

It most cases training evaluation is concerned only with training performance and not with performance on-the-job after training. Before evaluation of on-the-job performance can be made it is necessary to make a need assessment, establish clear objectives and analyse the organization to determine factors which might make useless the best conceived training e.g. organizational conflicts.

65.

GOLDSTEIN IRWIN L.

Training in Work Organizations

Annual Review of Psychology

Palo Alto, Calif

(USA) pp.229-264 1980

pp.699

A critical article pointing out that efforts at evaluation appear to be evolving through a series of stages ranging from anecdotal trainee and trainer reactions to the development and understanding of the philosophy of intervention. The article divides evaluation into criterion issues and evaluation methodology. It is a good survey of the (mainly) psychological literature and has a useful bibliography, mostly from American sources.

66.

GOLDSTEIN IRWIN L.

Training: Program Development and Evaluation

Wadsworth Publishing

Belmont,
Calif.

(USA)

1974

pp.231

The book is addressed to those concerned with the systematic development and evaluation of training programmes in a variety of organizational settings. It is in three parts, assessment and evaluation, the learning environment and instructional approaches. Part One emphasises that once instructional needs are assessed and objectives determined, evaluation provides information useful in modifying the training programmes. Part Two presents the theoretical and empirical bases of learning, which provides the foundation for the design of instructional environments. Part Three explains a variety of instructional techniques. The author provides a general description and discussion of the evaluation data, with particular emphasis on the questions that must be answered, and summaries of the advantages and disadvantages of each approach.

67.

GORDON M.E.

Three Ways to Effectively Evaluate Personnel Programs

Personnel Journal

(USA)

51(7)

July 1972

pp.7

It is argued that failure to validate personnel programmes can be expensive, although the actual costs are difficult to estimate. The failure to assess the effectiveness of personnel procedures frequently is traceable to misguided notions concerning the necessity of validation. The evaluation of personnel programmes cannot be managed on the basis of intuition and good intention. There will be need for greater sophistication to properly direct the process of programme evaluation. The use of behavioural objectives will assist in overcoming the criterion problem in programme evaluation.

68.

GOSLIN R.C.

Defining Contexts and Procedures for Effective
Evaluation of Course Programmes

International Review of Administrative Sciences

1

1976

pp.9

This article comprehensively covers the approaches to evaluation at a generalised level dealing with the levels and context of evaluation, the essential elements, the construction of evaluation measures, evaluation roles and objectives and control, data collection and interpretation. It is not a step by step guide to evaluation but an article designed to raise important issues in the minds of trainers.

69.

GOSLIN R.C.

Methodological Approaches in Public Administration
Training

International Review of Administrative Sciences

XLI(1)

1975

pp.15

This article by a very experienced trainer and academic deals with the general question of methodology in public administration but the bulk of it is concerned with evaluation. Without offering easy solutions, it raises most of the important issues and relates them to a systems approach to training.

70.

GRENOUGH JOHN L. &
DIXON ROY W.

Using "Utilization" to Measure Training
Results

Training

(USA)

Feb. 1982

pp.3

The article describes a technique for evaluating the success of a training programme by determining the degree of utilization of what was taught. It involves either Direct Results Measurement or Retrospective Results Measurement. In the former a mail survey (example given) is sent to each participant three months after the course and he completes the form indicating usage of his knowledge. The latter measurement involves a telephone survey of a representative sample. The technique is based on the belief that if trainees do not use the training there are no problem solving results.

71.

GUYOT JAMES F.

Management Training and Post Industrial Apologetics

California Management Review

XX(4)

1978

pp.10

The Kepner-Tregoe and Managerial Grid management training programmes have been very widely used for twenty years but there has been little evaluation of their effects. This is a very useful article which examines reports on the evaluation of these programmes in a number of American and British organizations. It deals with criteria, controls and placebos. It considers that the programmes are mainly justified by faith and that there are few incentives to either producers or users of training packages to validate their wares.

72.

GUYOT JAMES F.

How Do We Know Which Training is Good Medicine for Managers?

Public Administration Review

(USA) 37(6) Nov/Dec 1977 pp.8

It is explained that training, especially that undertaken at the managerial level is often thought to be a rewarding investment in the future, but we have so far little evidence of its pay-off. The author reports the studies of two training programmes indicating the methodological difficulties in making an evaluation of such training. The possible approaches for research to improve the quality of training are outlined. In this context, the aspects of control group and training effect are discussed.

73.

HAMBLIN A.C.

Evaluation and Control of Training

McGraw Hill

London

(UK) 1974 pp.208

This book, which is designed for the training specialist, is also very useful for anyone concerned with the management of training. After considering the place of evaluation in the training process and producing a useful model of the cycle of evaluation, Hamblin sets out the strategies and objectives of evaluation starting at the cost-benefit approach and proceeding through the job-related approach to the training centred approach and the evaluation of external courses. This is then followed by a lengthy section on the tactics and techniques to be employed in evaluation.

This book is very satisfactory in both theoretical and practical terms, recognizing that what is objectively right may not be politically expedient.

The author points out that the purpose of evaluation is not to determine if desired changes did occur but rather to determine what should happen next. As a result of this open-ended approach he believes that it is hardly ever possible to set up a scientifically controlled evaluation experiment.

This is a very important book at both philosophical and practical levels.

74.

HAND H.H. &
SLOCUM J.W.A Longitudinal Study of the Effects of a Human
Relations Training Programme on Managerial
Effectiveness

Journal of Applied Psychology

(USA) 56(5) 1972 pp.6

A report on a study of a human relations programme in an American steel plant with a description of method, results and implications. One of the key results was an indication that follow up evaluations can occur too soon and that there is an important lag effect when time allows an opportunity for reinforcement of newly acquired attitudes and behaviour.

75.

HAND H.H.,
RICHARDS M.D. &
SLOCUM J.W.Organizational Climate and the Effectiveness of a
Human Relations Training Program

Academy of Management Journal

16(2) 1973 pp.21

Ninety days after a human relations training programme little change in the attitudes and behaviours of managers was noticed. Eighteen months later significant positive changes in attitudes existed in the experimental group while negative changes were observed in the control group. This rather technical article is of interest to trainers as possibly reversing some of the conclusions of the Hawthorne study and being an important indicator as to the appropriate timing of post training evaluations.

76.

HAND H.H.

Mystery of Executive Education - Effectiveness
Requires Evaluation

Business Horizons

(USA) 14(3) 1971 pp.4

The problems in the evaluation of management development programmes are identified. These include: defining parameters, verbalising the basic assumptions, and evaluating the results. For useful evaluation, objective criteria should replace subjective criteria and multiple rating may supplement self-evaluation. The programme should provide an opportunity to define objectives with respect to change; the systematic evaluation of the value of executive development expenditures as well as a basis for revising future programmes.

77.

HARMAN FRANCIS L. &
GLICKMAN ALBERT S.

Managerial Training - Reinforcement Through
Evaluation

Public Personnel Review

(USA) Oct. 1965 pp.5

Dealing first with the elements of effective training, this paper goes on to give a report on Kepner-Tregoe training in management problem analysis and decision making. The pre, post and follow up questionnaires used are set out. Each is in open-ended form. The authors claim that asking about follow up plans increases the likelihood that follow up actually occurs. As well, they believe that feedback to supervisors increases follow up.

78.

HARTLEY JAMES

Evaluating the Effectiveness of Training in
Ivor K. Davies (ed)

The Organization of Training

McGraw Hill

Maidenhead

(UK)

1973

pp.23

Using Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives evaluation is considered in terms of cognitive, affective and psychomotor objectives and appropriate evaluation strategies are set out. Tests are described with their advantages and limitations for measuring each of cognitive, effective and psychomotor objectives. A useful piece of work for the practising trainer.

79.

HARTMANN HEINZ

The Evaluation of Management Training

International Studies of Management and Organization

X(1-2)

1980

pp.16

There is now reason to shift the focus of evaluation from methodology to questions of research strategy. The first part of the article reports on managerial reactions to management training as determined by a large survey in Europe in 1974-75. The second part deals with the strategy of evaluation and sets out the lessons to be learnt from these reactions (1) it is meaningless to evaluate management training so long as we cannot evaluate management (2) management training implies a transmission of values as much as a transfer of knowledge (3) in the evaluation of training we must distinguish among individual, organizational and societal systems of reference (4) evaluation should include measures of legitimacy and participation (5) the evaluation must include the latest results of training (6) evaluation should build on an analysis of the environmental relationships of the system of training.

80.

HESSELING P.

Strategy of Evaluation Research

Van Gooicum & Co

Assen

1966

pp.359

This classic book is one of the major works on the subject of evaluation. The first part deals with theoretical issues, the second with putting the principles of evaluation into action while the third endeavours to formulate a general strategy of evaluation research and answer the question of how the best use can be made of the various methods which are available.

The author has aimed his book at social scientists and policy makers as well as training officers and this is one of its weaknesses. A great deal of information in the book goes far beyond what the usual practitioner in the field of training is likely to require.

On the other hand, it gives the reader a useful insight into sampling and observational methods, the use of opinion scales, interaction process analysis, and deals adequately with the training officer as an evaluator.

81.

HICKERSON KARL A. &
LITCHFIELD HARRY E.Professionalism vs Salesmanship - Focussing
on Evaluation Procedure at John Deere

Training and Development Journal

April 1978

pp.7

The authors believe that many "how to sell training" problems can be overcome through a system of evaluation which helps structure the communication of training information in a useful and palatable form. The authors believe the right approach is to establish criteria or standards for evaluating the programme before the programme and set out a "pre-work evaluation form" which is used before or after the course.

82.

HOLDER JACK J.

Evaluation of an In-Company Management Training Program

Training and Development Journal

(USA) 26(4) April 1972 pp.4

This is a research report on changes in behaviour of participants and their organization. It is indicated that the extent of benefits from the in-company training programmes will depend on several factors e.g. the true effectiveness of the trainer and his ability to impart knowledge in a classroom situation; ability of participants to grasp the material and synthesize the theory with their knowledge of practical application to get active results; and the superior-subordinate relationship where the supervisor's attitude will greatly determine the extent to which the trainee applies the new learning to his job.

83.

HONEY PETER &
MORRIS MICHAEL

Practical Experiences in Evaluating Management Training

Personnel Management

(UK) Jan. 1973 pp.5

A very practical report on the evaluation of a large scale management skills programme carried out at ICL. Much is made of the desirability of involving management so as to obtain clear cut objectives for the training course. Useful direct measures for during course evaluation are suggested. A useful warning (with details) of the perils of post course evaluation is included together with highly practical advice on not letting evaluation take over from training.

84.

HORRIGAN J. THOMAS

The Effects of Training on Turnover - a Cost
Justification Model

Training and Development Journal

July 1979

pp.5

Recognizing that evaluating behavioural change as a result of training is often very expensive in time and money, the author suggests that an analysis of trainee versus non trainee turnover may be an acceptable substitute. A description is given of a case study in a data processing firm, a model is put forward and the documentation required is set out.

85.

HOUSE ROBERT J.

Leadership Training

Administrative Science Quarterly

12

1967

pp.16

A useful discussion of how social influences in the work environment explain why leadership training produces both functional and dysfunctional consequences. The effects of leadership training can be predicted from structural factors within the organization, particularly (1) their congruence with the prescriptions of training (2) the clarity of their relevance to trainee reward and punishment (3) their tendency to induce anxiety in the trainee.

86.

HUCZYNSKI A.A. &
LEWIS J.W.An Empirical Study into the Learning Transfer
Process in Management Training

Journal of Management Studies

XVII

1980

pp.13

A much neglected area of evaluation research in training has been the working environment to which the trainee returns. This paper is a small scale study on how learning transfer to the job can be maximized. Dealing with comparatively simple areas of study the authors collected data on attempts made by students to introduce learned knowledge and found the main inhibiting factors to be work overload, crisis work, difficulty in convincing others and a high rate of change. Above all, the learner's immediate superior is crucial to the use of learned knowledge.

87.

JACOBS J.

The Evaluation of Study Programmes

Victoria University of Manchester

undated

pp.43

This very short book is primarily concerned with the evaluation of the study programmes of students from LDC's studying in Britain. The first part deals with approaches to evaluation, including follow-up research and the second part with the evaluation experience of donors and donor agencies.

Appendix A is useful for the programme questionnaire to be given to each participant in a course at entry point.

88.

JONES J.A.G.

Towards a Classification of Benefits of Training
European Training

(UK)

1(3)

1972

pp.10

A survey of the cost-benefit analysis of training revealed three broad categories of benefits: direct changes, indirect changes and long-term changes. These are identified and discussed. Some of these categories include: changes in the performance of others affected by the work of the trainees, changes in the levels of ability and changes in the degree of flexibility or adaptability. The discussion emphasises the context of operative training.

89.

JONES J.A.G.

The Costs and Benefits of Management Training

Personnel Management

(UK)

Sept. 1973

pp.4

The theoretically best way of evaluating training by using the techniques of cost benefit analysis are unreal because of the impossibility of gathering enough data. Instead the author proposes the use of a concept of "training potential". After determining this it is possible to estimate the actual return which could be achieved. In turn this identifies the main constraints in the working environment.

90.

JOYCE L.

Participants' Reactions to Different Types of
Training Courses

Management Education and Development

(UK)

11

1980

pp.11

To base an evaluation of a training course purely on participants' reactions is usually recognized as being the poorest way. Nevertheless it is often the only available way. This article reports on an attempt to use this method for a range of short courses in the Irish civil service. The courses varied widely but a standard questionnaire was used focussing on common elements. The results suggest that a key element differentiating between the different types of courses may be the type of prior consensus and agreement which can be formed about the content, objectives and strategy of the course.

91.

KANE J.S.

The Evaluation of Organisational Training Programmes

Journal of European Training

5(6)

1976

pp.56

This is a long, comprehensive and specialised article which deals at length with the problems and techniques of experimental design. It covers the classic experimental approach, the generally more useful quasi-experimental design, the interrupted time series design, the multiple time series, multiple temporal stretches and regression discontinuity. It also deals with non-experimental designs, correlation designs and covers the constraints on the choice of evaluation design.

It can be recommended only for trainers concerned to make evaluation the major part of their job.

92.

KAYLOFF ALVIN G.

A Method for Evaluating the Effectiveness of Technical
Training

Training and Development Journal

(USA)

25(6)

June 1971

pp.7

A matrix approach for classifying tasks by importance and training levels is explained. It is stated that task proficiency measurement for a technical training course is relatively simple to collect. Training level is an objective for courses and task importance estimates can be readily obtained for any job by conducting a job survey. The matrix approach thus is useful for the evaluation of existing training courses or the establishment of training level for new courses

93.

KEARSLEY GREG &
COMPTON TERRYAssessing Costs, Benefits & Productivity in
Training Systems

Training and Development Journal

35:52-58 Jan. 1981

An article by two experts in cost-benefit analysis setting out four approaches to assessing training efficiency and effectiveness - resource requirement models; life cycle models; benefit models and productivity models. Each model is represented diagrammatically and some use is made of simple mathematics. It is pointed out that the four models represent a development sequence which corresponds to the increasing availability of data.

94.

KIBLER R.J. ET AL

Objectives for Instruction and Evaluation

Allyn & Bacon

Boston

(USA)

1974

This book is intended as a supplementary text for courses in education and is of comparatively small value to trainers. However the 29 pages devoted to evaluation may be of interest to trainers with an educational background as they deal with norm referenced vs criterion referenced evaluation; implementing a criterion referenced evaluation system; problems of such a system and; mastering learning.

95.

KILMANN R.H. &
HERDEN R.P.Towards a Systemic Methodology for Evaluating the
Impact of Interventions on Organizational Effectiveness

Academy of Management Review

1(3)

July 1976

pp.11

While concerned with organizational interventions which go beyond training, the article produces a useful evaluation model, a model of organizational effectiveness and a diagram of measures of organizational effectiveness. It points out that the choice of evaluation methodology should be made by several individuals each with a different perspective and each change agent should make explicit his values, needs and ethics.

96.

KIRKPATRICK D.L.

Evaluation of Training in R.L. Craig (ed)

Training and Development Handbook

McGraw Hill

New York

(USA)

1976

The handbook is an extremely comprehensive product arranged as a series of forty-seven articles, by leading practitioners from the USA, in almost every aspect of training. It is arranged in five sections which embrace the training and development function, programme development, applications in training, media and methods and training and development resources.

Kirkpatrick's chapter is well up to the standard of the rest of the book and covers in detail and with examples the four stages of evaluation - reaction, learning, behaviour and results. He also provides a useful list of references and a bibliography of American material mostly dated from before 1972. The article can be recommended for all except specialists in evaluation.

97.

KIRKPATRICK D.L. (ED)

Evaluating Training Programmes

American Society for Training and
DevelopmentMadison,
Wis.

(USA)

1975

pp. 313

This is a collection of articles on evaluation from earlier issues of the Journal of the American Society for Training and Development. The editor is a very well known writer on evaluation and he has divided the book into five parts - techniques, reaction, learning, behaviour and general - which correspond reasonably closely with his own technique of dealing with evaluation under the four headings of reaction, learning, behaviour and results.

Most of the articles are short and oriented to the practitioner of supervisory and management training. Some of the articles contain useful examples of questionnaires used by the author(s) in evaluation practice.

98.

KIRKPATRICK D.L.

Evaluating In-House Training Programs

Training and Development Journal

Sept. 1978 pp.4

This is another of a long series of articles by Kirkpatrick on evaluation. It covers guidelines, evaluating learning, on-the-job behaviour and determining results in a brief and simplistic fashion.

99.

KIRKPATRICK D.L.

Evaluating Training Programs: Evidence vs Proof

Training and Development Journal

Nov. 1977 pp.4

In this brief paper, Kirkpatrick briefly discusses the question of providing proof that training has been successful. He recognises its difficulties and costs but insists on its importance.

100.

KOHN VERA (comp)

A Selected Bibliography on the Evaluation of Management Training and Development Programs

American Foundation for Management Research

(USA) 1969 pp.25

The book contains 61 items published between 1959 and early 1969. Five categories covered include research studies, literature reviews, discussion on evaluation techniques, surveys of corporate practices and books. Aspects covered are participant satisfaction, interpersonal competence, sensitivity and human relations training, program planning, behaviour and attitude change, reinforcement and managerial grid.

101.

KOHN VERA &
PARKER TREADWAY

Management Development and Program Evaluation -
Partners in Promoting Managerial Effectiveness

American Foundation for Management Research

1969

pp.124

This is a very detailed evaluation study of the results of a four week management course in a large American company. Some of the methodology is old and it is doubtful if a modern research would return the same favourable results. However this is a model of thoroughness for emulation by any training group concerned with producing a similar study. It has good examples of questionnaires and a rather outdated bibliography.

102.

KUMAR U.

Evaluation of Training Programmes in the Paradigm
of Research

ASCI Journal of Management

Hyderabad

(India) 5(2)

March 1976

pp.5

The problems in evaluation are examined in the background of four main issues: (a) Goal attainment model of training and evaluation; (b) Purpose of evaluating training programmes; (c) Methodology of evaluation; and (d) Organisational context of evaluation. It is explained that utilization of evaluation findings may depend upon the manner in which the results are reported. The involvement of individuals at different levels in understanding the training evaluation results may help in the incorporation of research findings that recommend further changes and refinement in the subsequent training programmes. In the final analysis, the usefulness of evaluation depends upon the acceptance of the findings for future training activity and in the increased understanding of human and organisational functioning.

103.

LAIRD D.H.

Training Methods for Skills Aquisition

American Society for Training
and Development

1972

pp.119

Evaluation of training takes place in four stages -during planning; during learning; at the end of the programme; after the training has had time to impact. The 14pp of the section on evaluation concentrate upon producing quantifiable data and include several flow charts of the evaluation process.

104.

LAIRD D.

Approaches to Training and Development

Addison Wesley

Reading, Mass.

(USA)

1978

pp.303

This is a generally useful book for practitioners in the field of training covering such basic areas as "Why have a Training and Development Department" and "How do you find training needs?" going on to learning theory, training methods and teaching technique and concluding with chapters on the measurement and evaluation of training and the selection of training staff. It is aimed not only at newcomers to the profession but also at experienced practitioners.

The chapters on measurement and evaluation refer to training in lower level, more easily measureable skills and are of little value to trainers concerned with managerial training.

105.

LAUGHLIN T.C. &
KEDZIE D.P.

Building a Better Executive Development Mousetrap

Training and Development Journal

March 1980

pp.4

This article recounts the experience of the authors in a variety of public and private enterprises. It focuses on personal evaluation and suggests the use of "homework" when dealing with executives.

106.

LESTER R.I.

Criteria for Evaluating Training Materials

Training and Development Journal

(USA) 25(8) August 1971 pp.4

A checklist for objective assessment is provided and trainers are urged to give preference to 'objective evidence' in selecting instructional material. A set of eleven criteria are suggested as a guide. These include subject matter content, organisation, self-instructional aids, adaptability, costs and general evaluation.

107.

LIEN A.J.

Measurement and Evaluation of Learning

Wm. C. Brown & Co.

Dubuque

(USA) 1967 pp.220

The book attempts to acquaint the reader with the measurement and evaluation phase of the threefold tasks: Where am I going? How am I going to get there? How well have I and my students arrived? Once an explanation of the tasks is understood, the remainder of the book moves into the practical aspects of measurement and evaluation. The book is organised in four parts: Part One deals with foundations of measurement and evaluation, Part Two with techniques of measurement, Part Three with presentation and analysis of data collected through measurement and Part Four discusses the application of measurement and evaluation.

108.

LIPPITT GORDON L.

Criteria for Evaluating Human Resource Development

Training and Development Journal

30(10) October 1976 pp.8

The purpose of the paper is to present the need for stated criteria for planning and evaluating the process of human resource development concerned at the level of individual, group, organisation and society. Concepts and methods to produce evaluation are outlined based on information system, organisation support and participant commitment.

109.

LOPEZ FELIX M.

Evaluating Employee Performance

Public Personnel Association

Chicago

(USA)

1968

pp.306

This book is not directly concerned with the evaluation of training but part 2 - Techniques and Applications - is of direct relevance to trainees seeking to measure performance on the job after a training course is over. The 124pp of this part deal with measuring human performance (23pp); evaluating the person (25pp); evaluating results (25pp); the evaluation interview (21pp); and evaluation at the top (23pp). The book is comprehensive with charts and examples and a large bibliography.

110.

LUSHER BRIAN

Training the Experienced Manager

Industrial & Commercial Training

4(2)

Dec. 1972

pp.11 (4 on
evaluation)

A description of the author's experience in starting up systematic management training in a large electronics firm. In evaluation the author used pre , during and post session, questionnaires in what is now a standard way and compares the results between courses. He believes that anecdotal follow up is important as it provides a fairly honest view of the value of the programme.

111.

LYNTON R.P. &
PAREEK U.

Training for Development

Irwin Dorsey

Homewood, Ill.

(USA)

1967

pp.408

This is another of the basic texts on the field of training in general. It is divided into five parts - the aims, patterns and process of training; the pre-training phase; the training phase; the post-training phase and the institution and the future.

Unfortunately the eleven pages devoted to evaluation skimp both the problems and practices of evaluation and are not up to the standard of the rest of the book. They cannot be recommended for anyone concerned with the evaluation of management training.

112.

MAANEN JOHN VAN

The Process of Program Evaluation

National Training and Development
Service PressWashington,
D.C.

(USA)

1973

pp.79

The book provides the training administrator with the tools to conduct more than a narrow range of evaluation. The author takes the position that seldom can one be certain a change was brought about by a specific program. Evaluation is viewed, therefore, as beginning with a rough conception of what is going on and concluding with a set of grounded recommendations. The strategy proposed in the book assumes that the objective of the evaluator is to help decision-makers develop the best program possible. The chapters include Evaluation Model, Evaluation Questions, Measurement Issues, and the Program Setting.

113.

MACK H.

Evaluating the Organisation Development Effort

Training and Development Journal

28(3)

Mar. 1974

pp.6

Rather than being concerned only with a training programme this article is concerned with the whole area of Organization Development. After covering the rationale of evaluation it deals with methods; when to evaluate, who should evaluate, degrees of expertise and measuring the unplanned intervention.

114.

MAHONEY THOMAS A.,
JERDEE THOMAS H. &
KORMAN ABRAHAMAn Experimental Evaluation of Management
Development

Personnel Psychology

(USA)

13

1960

pp.18

An introduction to the problems and methodology of training evaluation as perceived in the 1950s followed by a case study of the evaluation of a management training course in a large American industrial organization.

115.

MANSFIELD R.

Case Study in the Evaluation of Management Education

Management Education & Development

(UK) 5(1) 1974 pp.10

The author is concerned with the reasons for carrying out evaluation of management development programmes, the methods by which it may be done and the criteria to be analysed. These reasons are analysed. A case study of an evaluation effort is presented which is based on selected criteria. The three criteria discussed are attitude change, development of self-confidence and subjective assessment of participants.

116.

MARKWELL D.S. &
ROBERTS T.J.

Organisation of Management Development Programmes

Gower Press

London

(UK) 1969 pp.182 (16pp
on evaluation)

The book is divided into two parts - Designing the Programme and Management Development Case Histories. The first part contains 13pp which deal with the evaluation of training, divided into paragraphs covering subjective evaluation, measurement of increase in knowledge, year-after evaluation, evaluation by colleagues, management by objectives, examinations, evaluation of external training, the information bank and feedback. It has typical pre and post course evaluation questionnaires.

117.

McGHEE W. &
TULLAR W.

A Note on Evaluating Behaviour Modification and Behaviour Modeling as Industrial Training Techniques

Personnel Psychology

(USA) 31(3) Autumn 1978 pp.7

Behaviour modification has become increasingly popular as a training tool in industry and some positive evaluation results have been reported. McGhee and Tullar critically analyze the evaluations reported and find them all deficient to some degree. The article is useful for trainers with some psychological background.

118.

McNAMARA J. REGIS

Why Aren't They Doing What We Trained Them To Do?

Training

17:33-36 Feb. 1980

Because accountability has become very important in training, a particular concern is how much transfer of training took place. The article deals with the Training, Resource, Assessment, Intervention and Network System (TRAINS). The section on assessment deals with the principles of assessment methodology and suggests ways of strengthening transfer. The section on intervention suggests ways in which behaviour can be reinforced.

119.

MEIER T.K. &
PULICHERE JOSEPH P.Evaluating the Effectiveness of Assertiveness
Training

Training and Development Journal

34:66-68 Feb. 1980

Assertiveness training to overcome both passivity and aggression is now quite commonly in use with women, racial minority and short term employees. The article describes the evaluation of such a training programme in a large American oil company where positive results were achieved.

120.

MERRILL H. &
MARTING E. (EDS)

Developing Executive Skills

American Man. Assocn.

New York

(USA)

1958

pp.431

An older book which is a collection of papers by senior executives of private companies. The 8pp on the evaluation of the Management Development Program deals in a slight way with what is being evaluated, who wants what kind of evidence, current practice in evaluation (i.e. in the 1950s), effectiveness of the formal approach, under and over-emphasis on evaluation and what is needed to improve evaluation.

121.

MESSICK SAMUEL

The Standard Problem - Meaning of Values in Measurement
and Evaluation

American Psychologist

(USA) 30(1) Oct. 1975 pp.12

This is not a "how to do it" article but a useful philosophical discussion of the problems of bias in evaluation brought about by the personal values and ideological commitments of the evaluator whether from inside or outside the organization. The author endeavours to answer the dilemma of a choice between research that is dispassionate but irrelevant on the one hand and relevant but untrustworthy on the other.

122.

MEZOFF BOB

How to Get Accurate Self Reports of Training Outcomes

Training and Development Journal

35:56-61 Sept. 1981

Management trainers often find that when they use the self report approach to evaluation the results are disappointing with little apparent difference between the pre-training and post-training evaluations. This is due to what is known as the Response-Shift Bias where the trainee revises his standard for judging himself as a result of the training. This can be overcome by having the trainee complete both pre and post evaluations in the ordinary way then completing what is called a THEN evaluation in which he thinks back to the beginning of the programme and re-rates himself in the light of what he now knows. The article has supporting evidence and adequate references.

123.

MICHALAK D.F. &
YAGER E.G.

Making the Training Process Work

Harper & Row

New York

(USA) 1979 pp.152

Training needs to be seen as a management process within the total organization if it is to result in improved job performance. It is assumed that all training can and should be evaluated. Evaluation is seen as a critical part of the training process and in the 13pp devoted to it the authors make it clear that if a training process cannot be evaluated then it is unnecessary or the trainers have not done their homework. The chapter deals with reasons for evaluating training, accuracy, validity, reliability, usability and the four levels of evaluation.

124.

MIKESELL JOHN L.,
WILSON JOHN A. &
LAWTHER WENDELL

Training Program and Evaluation Model
Public Personnel Management

(USA) 4 Nov. 1975 pp.7

Much training is conducted with no real effort being made to establish its influence on job performance. This paper argues that performance evaluation is an integral part of any training programme and presents a useful training development model that includes such an evaluation. The model is illustrated by application to a training programme for auditors.

125.

MINDAK WILLIAM A. &
ANDERSON ROBERT E.

Can We Quantify an Act of Faith?

Training and Development Journal

25(5) May 1971 pp.8

Based on considering employees as assets and part of a systems approach for management training, a methodology is outlined for a pilot study in evaluation. Several implications and conclusions are reported. These include (1) management training can be quantified and measured by use of such tests as the semantic differential and the social perception analysis, (2) changes in attitude come about not only from instruction but also from experience working with key concepts, and (3) shifts in attitude were for the most part shortlived when executives returned to their companies.

126.

MONAT J.S.

The Evaluation of Training and Development
Programmes

Personnel Administration

July 1981 pp.47 (6pp
chart, tables,
bibliography)

Value judgements about the goodness of training are insufficient proof of training effects. Justification should be in organizational terms and the unanswered questions must be answered in terms top management understands. Systematic evaluation must be planned in advance. The article discusses what is evaluation; the criterion; evaluation strategies and cost-benefit analysis. It is directed at industrial training but its ideas are applicable to management training.

127.

MORANO RICHARD

Measurement and Evaluation of Training

Training and Development Journal

29(7)

July 1975

pp.6

The problem of evaluation is to define the measurement criteria for (a) evaluating courses of instruction from an educational point of view, and (b) evaluating programmes from an organizational point of view. Training needs have to be determined and the author suggests a matrix involving four key steps. Also recommended is a counselling mechanism to screen the right people into the programme adjusted against enrolment trends.

128.

MORRIS, LYN L. &
FITZ-GIBBON, CAROL T.

Evaluator's Handbook

Sage Publications

Beverly Hills

(USA)

1978

pp.133

This elaborate book is intended to assist people who are conducting evaluations of educational programmes. This is the first of a series of eight books designed to cover the whole field of evaluation. The Evaluator's Handbook is particularly useful for trainers as it deals with conceptualizing evaluation; how to play the role of formative evaluator; step-by-step guides for conducting a formative evaluation; step-by-step guide for conducting a summative evaluation and; a step-by-step guide for a small experiment. The remaining books in the set range from How to Deal with Goals and Objectives to How to Present an Evaluation Report and are of interest to the serious training evaluator.

129.

MORRISEY G.L. &
WALLSTEAD W.R.

Supervisory Training Can Be Measured

Training and Development Journal

June 1980

pp.5

This is a description of a technique which attempts to motivate supervisors to carry out improvements in the way they do their job after they return to their department or organization. Participants are required to determine specific objectives before the course is completed and then to send in a progress report 60 days later after which a Certificate of Completion is earned. The result is not an objective measurement but is a positive motivator to put into effect what has been learned.

130.

MOSES J.L. &
RITCHIE R.J.Supervisory Relationships Training - a Behavioural
Evaluation of a Behaviour Modeling Program

Personnel Psychology

29(3)

Autumn 1976

pp.7

A report of an attempt to overcome the difficulties of evaluating behavioural modeling programmes. A control group was used but the evaluation was carried out in a specially constructed assessment centre using managers unfamiliar with either the programme or the study participants. Very positive results are reported. This would be useful in large organizations when a trial programme needs to be proved.

131.

MUMFORD ALAN

The Manager and Training

Pitman

London

(UK)

1971

pp.152 (11pp
on evaluation)

The chapter gives a cursory treatment of the problem and methods of evaluation. Areas dealt with are reports on courses; validation of training; assessing post training performance and; reasons for poor results in training.

132.

NEWSTROM JOHN W.

Evaluating the Effectiveness of Training Methods

Personnel Administrator

25

1980

pp.6

This is a follow up of a 1970 study and the article clearly shows that there is no one best method of training. Two hundred training directors were polled for their views. The report analyses the 54 usable replies and sets out in a matrix nine methods of training and their perceived use for attaining training objectives. The author is careful to note that the results may not be universally applicable.

133.

O.E.C.D.

Evaluation of Supervisory and Management Training Methods

O.E.C.D.

Paris

1963

pp.159

This older text is an exhaustive approach to the problems of training evaluation. It deals in Part I with the concept of evaluation (7pp), the difficulties of the evaluation of training (12pp), the history of training evaluation (10pp). In Part II it is concerned with technical questions of evaluation, including training objectives and evaluation criteria (15pp) and evaluation instruments (10pp). Part III describes some attempts at evaluation while Part IV covers methodological considerations in the evaluation of training (17pp). The book shows clearly how little advance there has been in training evaluation since the early 1960s.

134.

ONTO J.G.

OD Evaluation - the State of the Art

Human Resource Management Australia

Winter 1981

pp.11

Onto deals with the considerable interest in OD programmes and points out this interest is not matched by interest in the evaluation of the programmes. He discusses whether OD should be evaluated, what constitutes sound research design (inc. a useful table of rival hypotheses in an OD framework) the realities of organizational research. He gives a case study of an attempt to evaluate a Managerial Grid programme and briefly discusses some emerging trends.

135.

OTTO C.P. &
GLASER R.O.

The Management of Training

Addison-Wesley

1970

pp.403

The 13pp devoted to evaluating training outcomes stress the need for evaluation, behaviour evaluation and results evaluation. Most of the text is devoted to learning evaluation with useful information on types of test e.g. oral, performance, multiple choice, etc. Hints on construction as well as pros and cons are discussed.

136.

PARKER T.C.

Evaluating: The Forgotten Finale of Training
Personnel

(USA) 5(6) 1973 pp.5

The evaluation of any training must be done against the objectives of the training programme. However, it is not the only factor to be evaluated. Four categories are involved in the evaluation: job performance, group performance, participant satisfaction, and participant knowledge gain. After the selection of criteria of evaluation from the above, some technique such as questionnaire, job sample test, visual observation, rating forms etc. can be selected depending upon the suitability.

137.

PARKINS C.R.

Evaluation: Problems and Possibilities for the
Training Profession

I.S.T.D. Review

(India) 2(3-4) 1972 pp.6

The question of evaluation is pointed out as the most significant issue confronting the trainer and the training profession as it rightly forms a part of administrative/management and organizational development. Evaluation is analysed not only as a post-training exercise but as a process which must be integrated with the total training experience. Finally, a plea is made for more extensive use of social and behavioural science methods and data which could give an empirical base to the assessment of training.

138.

PEDERSEN KJELD M.

A Proposed Model for Evaluation Studies

Administrative Science Quarterly

22 June 1977 pp.11

This is a technical approach to the production of a general evaluation model which can be used to evaluate training operations. It describes the development of the model, its characteristics and has generalized diagrams. It is of most use to evaluators with some knowledge of mathematics.

139.

PHILLIPS D.C.

When Evaluators Disagree: Perplexities and Perspectives

Policy Sciences

8

1977

pp.12

This paper raises the question of what administrators should do when evaluators, each seemingly expert in the field, disagree on the value of work performed. After discussing the various functions of the evaluation process, the author recommends that if the administrator is concerned solely with making a rationally defensible decision, then he should select his evaluating panel so that all members share the same general orientation.

140.

PRAHLAD C.K.

Measurement of Training Effectiveness: A Quantitative Approach

Economic & Political Weekly

Bombay

(India) 7(48)

pp.10

The paper attempts to introduce a quantitative approach to the evaluation of training effectiveness by classifying the total training effort into Action and Developmental training. A present-value approach is developed to evaluate Action Training projects. Human Resource Accounting concepts have been extended to evaluate the impact of Developmental Training. A procedure is also evolved for capitalising investments in training.

141.

PUTMAN A.O.

Pragmatic Evaluation

Training & Development Journal

Oct.1980

pp.5

A useful comparison by an experienced practitioner of the differences between the "truth-seeking" (i.e. scientific) and pragmatic paradigms as applied to the evaluation of human resource development. It points out the inappropriateness of the "scientific" approach and gives an eight step programme for putting into effect the pragmatic approach.

142.

RACKHAM N.

Recent Thoughts on Evaluation

Industrial and Commercial Training

(UK) 5(10) Oct. 1973 pp.8

A thought provoking and useful article to every trainer which deals with the marked difference in evaluation results when comparing participative and non participative sessions. After examining the results the author proposes two types of evaluation - long cycle and short cycle. Long cycle is for non participative courses and the evaluation is primarily for the trainer. Short cycle (which occurs constantly during training) is for participative training and is for the immediate benefit of the trainee. The article is suitably illustrated.

143.

RACKHAM N. &
MORGAN T.

Behaviour Analysis in Training

McGraw Hill

Maidenhead

(UK) 1977 pp.327

This book is a detailed explanation with examples of what is claimed to be a new approach to interactive skills training which is designed to improve people's competence in dealing with others. The monograph is aimed at the practising trainer and one part is devoted entirely to guidance on using the core techniques of behaviour analysis based on interactive skills training.

A key part of this is evaluation and much of the work is devoted to considering the various types including context and input evaluation, reaction evaluation and in-course or short-cycle evaluation. Most points are very thoroughly covered and the appendices contain good examples of questionnaires.

144.

RADER MARTHA H.

Evaluating a Management Development Program for Women

Public Personnel Management

(USA) 8(3) 1979 pp.7

A report on the evaluation of a programme only for women using the Attitudes Towards Women and Adult Self Expression Scale. The results seem to be culture specific.

145.

REEVES ELTON T. &
JENSEN MICHAEL J.

Effectiveness of Program Evaluation

Training and Development Journal

(USA) 26(2) Jan. 1972 pp.6

The study reports on evidence about verification of participant evaluation. This includes (1) whether the evaluation of identical programmes by separate groups of participants with similar educational needs are comparable, (2) if the participants' evaluation is transitory, are the participants' evaluations a function of time, and (3) whether the institution's evaluations of its own programmes are compatible with those of the participants.

146.

REILLY W.

Training Administrators for Development

Heinemann: London

1979 pp.154

This short handbook, designed to be read by both trainers and those responsible for management in developing countries, is far from exhaustive but it usefully deals with training and the public service, the design and content of training programmes, training methods, evaluation and the management of training institutes.

The nine pages devoted to evaluation are disproportionately small in view of the importance of the topic but they do clearly set out the problems the evaluator meets, ranging from resistance and expense to misunderstanding and the time factor. There is a brief section on methods of evaluating training programmes but this topic is much better covered elsewhere.

147.

REYNOLDS M.

Effect of Training Interventions on Management Relationships

European Training

(UK) 1(1) 1972 pp.8

The author investigates the training variable in the scheme of relationships and discusses how much effective collaboration takes place in an organization as a function of the balance between various aspects of the human relationships involved. It is suggested that a training intervention may upset the balance more significance for management training.

148.

RIZZO JOHN R.

The Evaluation of Management Development in
Robert J. House (ed)

Management Development - Design, Evaluation
and Implementation

Univ. of Michigan

Ann Arbor

1967

pp.18

Although this is an older text it sets out all the necessary information for the trainer wishing to commence an evaluation programme. The main areas dealt with are criteria; forms of criteria; sources of criteria; criterion measurement, experimental design and the use of control groups.

149.

ROY S.K. &
DOLKE A.M.

Evaluation of a Supervisory Training Programme

Training and Development Journal

(USA)

25 (12)

Dec. 1971

pp.5

The paper - a study of training effectiveness in selected textile mills in India - seeks to examine the key evaluation factor like reaction, learning, validity, reliability, participation and learning, and achievement motivation and learning. It is concluded that in spite of the obvious and fundamental need to evaluate aspects of training programmes, trainers feel shy of the task. Trainers have to be careful to plan evaluation before the programme and not to hunt for data after it is all over.

150.

SALINGER RUTH D. &
DEMING BASIL S.

Practical Strategies for Evaluating Training

Training and Development Journal

Aug. 1982

pp.9

An outline of six evaluation strategies designed to give answers to the basic question of evaluation. The strategies (delayed treatment control group; modified critical incident; over-the-shoulder evaluation; performance analysis; time-series; cost benefit) are all set out in reasonable detail to be useful to trainers unfamiliar with them.

151.

SANKAR Y.

A Conceptual Framework for the Evaluation of
Management Development Programs

Management International Review

18(3) 1978

pp.16

This is a complex article aimed at producing a conceptual framework for the evaluation of training in management development mainly at the level of instruction. It deals with instructional design and evaluation; current concepts of evaluation; elements of the instructional plan and learning typology and evaluation. It is well illustrated with diagrams and the issues raised are important to both the educator and trainer.

152.

SCHWARZ PAUL A. &
KRUG ROBERT E.Ability Testing in Developing Countries -
A Handbook on Principles and Techniques

Praeger Publishers

London

1972

pp.245

The book, an outcome of extended research in different countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America, outlines various aspects of testing in four main elements: basic issues, techniques of test adaptation, practical test applications and developing local testing resources. The concept is extended even to include programmes of reform in a developing country, and as a reference manual to be consulted selectively at various stages of implementation. The areas discussed in detail include abilities to be measured, the design of suitable tests and the design of effective testing procedures.

153.

SCHWIND HERMANN

Issues and Problems in Training Evaluation (1)

Canadian Training Methods

Oct. 1975

pp.3

A short discussion of scientific and quasi scientific evaluation methodologies which reaches the conclusions (1) to be scientific is a matter of degree (2) there are more or less useful designs for practitioners (3) it is possible to get useful and valid results with quasi-experimental designs without control groups (4) practitioners should choose a design according to the purpose of the results and not according to rigid scientific standards.

154.

SEPPALA G.R.

An Approach to Determining the Value of Managerial Training

American Society for Training
and Development

Pomona,
Calif.

1978

pp.26

While measuring reactions and learning does not provide an adequate base for determining the value of training measuring increases in organization productivity brought about by training does. This paper is directed primarily at the public sector and provides a generalized model for determining the value of training using measures of change in on-the-job behaviour. The paper also provides instruction on how to apply the model to reach a quantifiable result.

155.

SIFFIN W.J.

Factors Involved in the Evaluation of Management Training Institutions in Inayatullah (ed)

Management Training for Development - The Asian Experience

Asian Centre for Development
Administration

Kuala
Lumpur

1975

pp.300

This book comprises a collection of papers mostly by the heads or senior members of various institutions in Asia concerned with management training for development. They relate mainly to the building of special institutions designed to improve managerial competence in Asian countries but are of much wider interest to any person interested in managerial training. The chapter contributed by William Siffin is concerned with the evaluation of management training institutions but it is a very useful essay on the whole question of evaluating management training. Recognising that the ideal criterion is the effect of the training but that this cannot actually be measured, Siffin puts forward the proposition that evaluation should be based on the acceptability of the training to the trainers, to the organisation's key professional, technical and administrative personnel and to those who provide the resources for the training.

The article also gives a useful short selected bibliography of material from the United States.

156.

SMITH MARTIN E.

Evaluating Training Operations and Programmes

Training and Development Journal

Oct. 1980

pp.9

Because of the problems involved in evaluation trainers will optimize their own operations at the expense of serving the needs of the parent organization and training programmes will be irrelevant so that trainees do their learning on the job. The article lists eight implications for action and proposes the institutionalization of evaluation.

157.

SMITH, M.

Using Repertory Grids to Evaluate Training

Personnel Management

(UK)

Feb. 1978

pp.3

The author shows how repertory grids used by clinical psychologists since 1955 can be used to produce "before" and "after" mental maps of trainees. The possibility of faking results is seen as being extremely remote and bias is largely reduced. Further it is easy to perceive and understand the changes which have occurred. The main weakness of the system is that responses need to be processed by computer.

158.

SMITH, M.E.

Evaluating Training Operations and Programs

Training and Development Journal

Oct. 1980

pp.9

This article is a useful one for all trainers, including those concerned with management training. It sets out the problems of training evaluation, the causes and the implications for action. It then sets out how the evaluation process may be institutionalized. It contains a useful evaluation matrix.

159.

SMITH PETER B.

Controlled Studies of the Outcome of Sensitivity Training

Psychological Bulletin

82(4)

1975

pp.25

A detailed study of the results of sensitivity training. It will be of value to trainers with a psychological background. It deals with issues such as global measures of self concept; perception of others; perception of trainee behaviour; and organizational behaviour after sensitivity training.

160.

STEEL M.H.

An Organised Evaluation of Management Training

Personnel Journal

Swarthmore,
Pa.

(USA)

51(10)

Oct. 1972

pp.5

The usual system requiring the participant to fill out a form at the end of the programme hardly constitutes a sufficient evaluation of the programme. It is only logical to analyse how participants succeed or fail in paying off in terms of improved job performance. The evaluation effort has to be built in the programme. The author has emphasized measuring the learning and change in behaviour. Some guideposts for evaluating behaviour are outlined.

161.

STEINER R.

New Uses for Assessment Centres - Training Evaluation

Personnel Journal

(USA)

54(4)

Apr. 1976

pp.13

It is argued that if trainers are unable to make their impact explicit and measurable, then on what basis can they ask for resources? In this context, the concept of an assessment centre is conceptualised as a training vehicle. Research indicates that participants view the assessment process as a learning experience. This is a logical outcome because most assessment materials and assessor training techniques are based on tried and true training methodology. Finally, the centre can be used as a highly accurate means for evaluating executive development or other types of training programmes. The paper explains how a trainer can successfully incorporate the concept into an overall training evaluation strategy.

162.

STEINER R. &
KELLY F.A Key Factors Approach to Assessing Management
Development

Personnel Journal

Santa Monica

(USA)

55(7)

July 1976

pp.5

There has been a failure to adequately evaluate the impact of management development programmes. The authors approach the problem by studying the relationships between participant characteristics and programmatic factors and relate these to measures of overall course reaction. The five indicators of course success were based on participant rating of course impact on specific plans to solve problems, impact on general knowledge level, recommendations to peers, subordinates and superiors, whether the course was worth the time and whether it met initial expectations. It is indicated that evidence probably supports the conclusion that those volunteering to attend find the course up to expectations. Some major implications for future research are suggested.

163.

STEVENSON GLORIA

Evaluating Training Daily

Training and Development Journal

May 1980

pp.3

A description of an effective feedback method used by the US Department of Labor's Employment Standards Administration in Washington. Used by the organization to test the progress of skill courses, the process involves a daily consultation between trainers and representatives of the group and normally lasts about 10 minutes. Results are reported as being good.

164.

STEWART V. & A.

Managing the Manager's Growth

Gower Press

Westead
Hants

1978

pp.257

This book has been designed for "anyone who has to help managers learn". It is a general book on training covering the fields of how managers learn; the diagnosis of training needs; internal and external courses; coaching and counselling; projects and assignments and the evaluation of training.

Although the book is designed with the range of management training in mind, the evaluation chapter is mainly concerned with the more measurable aspects of private sector management. It does not give any new insights into techniques but is useful for the points it raises about questionnaires distributed at the end of a training course and the need for evaluation to look beyond the simple responses to the underlying reason(s) for them.

165.

STOCKARD J.G.

Career Development and Job Training

American Management Association

1977

pp.434

This is a comprehensive book which deals in considerable detail with determining training needs, planning and developing solutions, delivering new knowledge and skill and examining results and determining the future course of action.

The eleven pages devoted to evaluation mainly deal in the generalities which will be familiar to most trainers and emphasise the necessity of a scientific approach with no consideration of the many difficulties involved. It does make the unusual suggestion of the introduction of a Board of Visitors to assist in evaluation efforts in the organization.

166.

STRUENING E.L. &
GUTTENTAG M. (EDS)

Handbook of Evaluation Research

Sage Publications

Los Angeles

(USA)

2 Vols

1975

pp.1432

This is one of the classic studies of evaluation in general, written and edited by 45 scholars and practitioners of evaluation. Vol.1 emphasizes conceptualization and design strategies while Vol.2 applies the techniques of evaluation research to selected content areas such as mental health.

Vol.1 is of most interest to those concerned with management training as it deals with the development and evaluation of measures; data collection through interviews and records; evaluation through social ecology; data analytic methods and the communication of evaluation results. Vol.2 contains sections on the politics and values involved in evaluation research and on the cost-benefit approach to evaluation.

The two volumes are at a high intellectual level and are of more use to the researcher than to the practising trainer.

167.

STUART ROGER &
BURGOYNE JOHN

The Learning Goals and Outcomes of Management Development Programmes

Personnel Review

(UK)

6(1)

Winter 1977

pp.11

The article presents and interprets some evidence from 15 different management development programmes on the part that teaching/learning events play in the total picture of managerial skills and their acquisition. It deals at length with what trainees saw as being derived from attendance at programmes. As well it is concerned with the overall effect of programmes and the relationship between goals and effects. The survey could be expected to have wide relevance.

168.

SUESSMUTH PATRICK

More Thoughts on Evaluation

Canadian Training Methods

April 1975

pp.4

An iconoclastic article which points out the deficiencies of the usual end of course evaluation and shows that in responding to any session or course students will invariably rate entertainment higher than learning. It concludes that evaluation forms measuring class reactions are useful but must be weighted against the type of lesson taught and that it should be kept in mind that students are not always honest.

169.

SUESSMUTH PATRICK

Finding the Dollar Return

Canadian Training Methods

Feb. 1975

pp.2

An attempt is made by the author to allow the trainer or supervisor to calculate the cost-benefit of any proposed training activity. The article gives a mechanistic step-by-step procedure for the calculations which will either make a convincing case for training or indicate that it is not the way to solve the problem.

170.

TALBOT J.R. &
ELLIS C.D.

Analysis and Costing of Company Training

Gower Press

Ch.14

1969

pp.13

The useful part of this chapter deals with value analysis applied to training. Value analysis is an organized procedure for the effective identification of unnecessary cost and its philosophy is based upon (1) what is being done can be improved (2) to recognize the factors in a problem and challenge assumptions is to begin to find a better solution (3) average people working together with a common aim will accomplish better than average results (4) neutral questioning will stimulate new thinking. The appendix (p.155) lists 15 questions that value analysts will ask about training.

171.

TAYLOR LAWRENCE

Evaluation of the Administrative Training
Programmes in the Southem Sudan 1975-77

Journal of Administration Overseas

(UK) XVII(3) 1978 pp.9

The evaluation of a Junior Administrator's Training Course is described, the material for which was drawn from five separately identified categories of informants. These groups included senior officials within the regional governments, upper middle-level line managers who had been supervisors of several ex-trainees, a cross section of ex-trainees who had performed well and less well and finally the observations of the author. The methodology also involved field visits to a number of administrative offices. The resulting evaluation suggested that the programme had a number of shortcomings. Future training needs had to be established and analysed. These steps could lead to options and priorities for future assistance.

172.

TERPSTRA D.E.

The Organizational Development Evaluation
Process

Human Resource Management

(US) pp.24-29 Spring 1981 6pp

OD evaluation must begin with outcome-oriented objectives rather than process-oriented statements. Ambiguous goals lead to ambiguous conclusions in evaluation. In discussing methodology and design problems, the article deals with sample-related problems, the difficulty of arranging for controlled experiments, troubles with measurement and problems regarding the interpretation of the results of OD evaluation studies. Finally it advocates the use of a Utility Theory framework which implies a careful identification and listing of all possible outcomes accompanied by a judgmental weighing of values in monetary and human terms.

173.

They Shoot Messengers, Don't They?: Breaking
the News to Management

Training

17:99-102 August 1980

One of the most difficult tasks in evaluation is breaking bad news to management. This article sets out eight steps to help with the task - know your audience; communicate as you go; plan the best media-time style; pilot test the presentation; deliver the bad news first; leave nothing to chance; expect to be rejected; evaluate. An unusual and useful article.

174.

THOMPSON JOHN T.

How to Develop a More Systematic Evaluation
Strategy

Training and Development Journal

July 1980 pp.5

The important and useful contribution made by the author is the production of a matrix of evaluation concerns dealing with in the left hand column the trainee, the organizational decision makers and the trainer. On the top it deals with criteria, validity concerns, methods, designs and problem areas. Very useful to all trainers before they commence an evaluation.

175.

THORLEY S.

Management Training - Is It Worth It?

Personnel Management

(UK) Jan. 1971 pp.5

The author discusses at length the difficulties of evaluating management training even using the Hesselting matrix. He gives an example of the evaluation of a management programme evaluation in a large British company and the difficulty of interpreting the results because of contaminants. An inconclusive article.

176.

THORLEY S.

Training Supervisors and the Cascade Effect
Personnel Management

(UK) 10(4) Apr. 1978 pp.3

A training kit for hospital supervisors was launched and later evaluated. The result has been a substantial increase in technical knowledge by the supervisors and a progressive development of their skills. The evaluation included before and after questionnaires, briefing, reaction scale, assessment of students and interview schedules. These instruments produced an evaluation matrix including level, technique and group. The evaluation has shown the scheme to be a worthwhile exercise but it has created expectation of further training and development which, if not pursued, may result in disillusionment and a deterioration in morale.

177.

TRACEY, W.R.

Designing Training and Development Systems

American Management Association

1971 pp.432

The stated aim of this comprehensive and sophisticated book is to help training managers and others involved in training and development to maximise the value of their efforts. It is a step-by-step guide to the design, development and validation of training and development systems.

The exhaustive chapters on evaluation deal with constructing evaluation instruments and criterion measures, evaluating training systems, administering and analysing criterion measures and following up graduates. The chapters are set out clearly and are well illustrated by diagrams, sample questionnaires, etc.

178.

TRACEY, W.R.

Training Evaluation - Another Perspective
Personnel Management

(UK) 9(2) Feb. 1977 pp.4

This is an effective short article which defines evaluation, lists its forms, gives its principles and sets out a ten step procedure to be followed in evaluation. It also deals with performance measures and the use of results as measures of evaluation.

179.

TRACEY, W.R.

Evaluating Training and Development Systems

American Management Assoc.

1968 pp.304

This book is not designed for trainers seeking to evaluate individual programmes but for trainers and their superiors who feel the need to carry out an audit of their training systems. As such it lists extensive questionnaires to be filled in by the trainer himself on the training sub-systems of philosophy and goals; buildings and facilities; management, staff and faculty; curriculum; instructional support. The appendix contains a guide to the evaluation of instruction (1) rating standards for lectures, etc. (2) rating standards for practical exercises.

180.

TRICE H.M. &
ROMAN P.M.

Evaluation of Training: Strategy, Tactics
and Problems

American Society for Training & Development

(USA) 1973 pp.49

Basic questions in training evaluation strategy are examined. Following this is a consideration of six approaches whereby evaluative questions may be posed including assumptions, advantages and disadvantages. The tactics of evaluation of training efforts and the basis for choosing different tactical approaches are discussed along with recent trends in training evaluation.

181.

UNITED NATIONS

Report of the Interregional Seminar on the
Development of Senior Administrators in the
Public Service of Developing Countries

Geneva 1

Aug. 1968

pp.3

Evaluation is the most arduous, nebulous and frustrating part of the training of senior administrators. A major and recurrent fault is too broad and ambiguous a definition of programme objectives. One decisive, although non-scientific evaluation is the market test. Other indicators are (1) its attraction to the ablest administrators (2) frequency of participants returning to attend other programmes (3) actual number of nominations (4) the extent to which a local programme is regarded as an acceptable substitute for training at a foreign institute.

182.

UNITED NATIONS

Methods and Problems of Evaluating Programs
for the Development of Senior Administrators

Report of the Interregional Seminar on the
Development of Senior Administrators in the
Public Service of Developing Countries,
Geneva, August 1968

Report and Technical Papers Vol.I

New York

1969

The purpose of the paper is to present some of the methods and problems of evaluating programs for the development of senior administrators. Three aspects of the subject are discussed: the concept of evaluation, the problems involved and the methods so far developed. Finally, the importance of evaluation is discussed. It is noted that evaluation offers protection against uninformed attacks on programmes and it should not be neglected because there are neither recognised methods nor easy answers to the problems which it presents. Finally, objectives on which evaluation is based should be derived from specific and differentiated development needs and should be tailored to fit the environment of work.

183.

UNIVERSITY OF
GHANA

Training Evaluation Survey

Greenhill Journal of Administration Achimota

(Ghana) 1(2) 1974 pp.22

This is a research report evaluating the training imparted to participants in Greenhill programmes between 1970 and 1973. The study had four objectives which are analysed in two parts: Employer's Evaluation and Participant's Evaluation. The participant's evaluation focussed on general views on training benefits and standard of the course, course content and training methods, choice of subjects and finally facilities and technical arrangements. The study revealed that formal post-training job evaluation is almost unheard of in many public institutions. It would be desirable for employers and heads of departments to institute formal evaluation procedures to evaluate all training courses attended by their employees.

184.

WALLACE M.J. &
WEITZEL W.The Feasibility of Experimental Evaluation of
Management Training Programs

Academy of Management Proceedings

Aug. 1972 pp.4

A brief report on an evaluation experiment in a large business firm seeking to find the results achieved by a one week management training program. A good description of a valid evaluation experiment based upon critical behaviours which could be replicated in the public sector in other countries. The authors claim that their experiment shows that measurement and experimental rigour is feasible in evaluating management training procedures.

185.

WARR P., BIRD M.
& RACKHAM N.

Evaluation of Management Training

Gower Press

London

1970

pp.111

This book is in three parts. The first part outlines some theoretical considerations which arise when training is to be evaluated. The second presents thirteen case studies concerned with the evaluation of the training of junior and middle managers. The third part considers some of the more general issues raised by the need to evaluate training.

Warr et al deal with evaluation in terms of what they call CIRO i.e. context, input, reaction and outcome. The book is not at a high level but is particularly useful for its commonsense approach, its case studies and its appendix on the construction and use of questionnaires. It does not possess any bibliography.

186.

WATSON C.E.

Management Development Through Training

Addison-Wesley

Reading,
Mass.

1979

pp.340

The fifty-two pages of this book devoted to evaluation cover the theoretical and practical grounds - with the emphasis on the latter - in a particularly comprehensive fashion. The various sub-sections deal with evaluation in general, who wants evaluation information, what does a suitable evaluation involve, a logical approach to collecting, organizing and interpreting evaluation data, the evaluation report and the practical dimension of evaluation.

187.

WEINSTEIN LAWRENCE W.

Collecting Training Cost Data

Training and Development Journal

Aug. 1982

pp.4

A slight article which concentrates on teaching the training evaluator how to accurately assess training programme costs based on Participant Learning Hours (PLH). Included is a figure setting out a cost framework in both absolute costs and PLHs.

188.

WEISS ROBERT S. &
REIN MARTINThe Evaluation of Broad Aim Programs:
Experimental Design, Its Difficulties and an
Alternative

Administrative Science Quarterly

15(1)

Mar. 1970

pp.13

The article is directed at broad aim programmes of social change such as are sometimes introduced by governments, but it is equally relevant to supervisory and management training programmes. It points out that classic experimental design is unsuitable in these types of programmes and proposes a qualitative study of development and change as an alternative. Aspects of such a qualitative study are discussed, including conceptual frameworks, ethical and value issues and problems associated with data collection and analysis.

189.

WEISS CAROL

Evaluation Research

Prentice-Hall

Englewood
Cliffs

1972

pp.160

Designed as a basic text in courses on evaluation research, it discusses the purposes and design of evaluation, and utilization of evaluation results. Sections on Evaluator's role and Formulating the question and measuring the answer have relevance for trainers.

190.

WEREKO T.B.

Training - a Dilemma? (How to Increase
Training Effectiveness)

Greenhill Journal of Administration Achimota

(Ghana) 1(3) 1974 pp.14

It is the contention of this paper that there is an essential spadework that must be done at five levels, by the Director of Training, the trainee's immediate supervisor, the trainee, the top management as well as the training institution concerned with training before anyone is sent on training. The author examines the objectives of training in Ghana, and describes the performance of the training institutions and the training techniques used. There is reference to determining training needs leading to choice of a useful training programme and learning on the course. It is only after these steps have been completed that management can accept training not only as necessary but beneficial.

191.

WERNHAM ROY

Getting the Measure of Management Training

Personnel Management

(UK) Mar. 1972 pp.4

Inadequate definition of objectives and measures of behaviour are two of the main difficulties in evaluating management training. This article is a description of how this problem was tackled in training courses of the then British Post Office. It describes the questionnaires used at various stages, the problems of reliability and points out that a full evaluation produces an appalling volume of paper and information. It concludes that the effort is not worthwhile for "one-off" courses.

192.

WHITELAW M.

The Evaluation of Management Training - A
Review

The Institute of Personnel Management London

(UK)

1972

pp.63

The evaluation of management training is beset by problems of definition and measurement, and the author feels that it is probably not possible in the great majority of cases to demonstrate its value in accounting terms. It is explained that in spite of lack of sophistication at this stage of development, we should do what we can at a level where we can visibly improve the quality of the training and demonstrate its values in terms of increased effectiveness. The concept, history and difficulties in evaluation of management training are discussed and the methods are illustrated by studies involving their use with emphasis on methodology rather than results. Intermediate outcome evaluation as a possible evaluation is indicated.

193.

WILLIAMS G.L.

The Validity of Methods of Evaluating Learning

Journal of European Training

5(1)

1976

pp.9

A largely theoretical article directed towards the researcher rather than the practical trainer. It defines evaluation and validity and product evaluation and learning objectives. The second part considers methods of evaluation including evaluation measures, experimental design in evaluation and the relationship between validity of evaluation and the level of objectives. It points out that higher level objectives are both the most necessary to measure and the least susceptible of measurement. The bibliography is mainly concerned with educational material.

194.

WITHANA R.M.

Evaluation of Administrative Training -
Some Training Experiences

Journal of Development Administration

(Sri Lanka) 4(1) May 1974 pp.18

In Sri Lanka the Academy of Administrative Studies was established in 1966. The author attempts to indicate the position and significance of evaluation in the network of activities comprising the overall training function: the limitations and difficulties in assessing the impact of training on the administration; the approaches in evaluating specific training programmes and the experiences in the Academy in this direction. A schematic model is presented to indicate the desirable links and the interrelationship of evaluation with the other activities. Also discussed are two of the course evaluations carried out in the Academy - the Management Development Course 1972 and the Seminar on Management Development for Senior Scientific and Technical Administrators 1973.

195.

WNUK JOSEPH J.

Evaluation of Conceptual Training

Training and Development Journal

Dec. 1966 pp.3

The author presents a 5-step procedure based on the premise that in conceptual training there are three factors that need to be considered (1) awareness of the concepts by the participants (2) understanding of them (3) commitment to them. The 5-step procedure endeavours to obtain these by written and oral commitment during the programme.

196.

WOODWARD NICHOLAS

The Economic Evaluation of Supervisor Training

Journal of European Training

4(3)

1975

pp.13

This paper outlines the rationale and difficulties of economic evaluations of supervisor training. It concludes that (1) curative training is more amenable to quantification than preventive training (2) where training is not geared to an existing organizational need the benefits will be difficult to identify (3) the availability of information in the organization will often determine the feasibility of evaluation (4) short cycle work is more amenable to evaluation than continuous production methods (5) in most training it is possible to estimate the costs but benefits will be difficult to measure in cash terms.

197.

ZENGEN JACK

The Painful Turnabout in Training

Training and Development Journal

34

Dec. 1980

pp.5

Training needs to be reorganized as it has lost credibility. Wrong theories have been followed, old and ineffective teaching methods have been used, training officers have followed fads and training has become peripheral. Above all evaluation research has been ignored without a search for assessment studies or real measures of behaviour change. Where evaluation does occur it has been largely ignored by the training community. The article lists 19 positive steps to improve management training.

198.

ZENGEN JOHN H. &
HARGIS KENNETH

Assessing Training Results - It's Time to Take
the Plunge

Training and Development Journal

Jan. 1982

pp.6

A strong plea for the evaluation of training which is likely to be threatened in a period of recession. This is a simple article for trainers who have not practised evaluation. It contains a research summary table showing the methodologies used and the results obtained in five organizations (two hospitals and firms dealing with electronics, pharmaceuticals and food).